



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastroenterology*

Manuscript NO: 99970

Title: Enhancing prognostic accuracy in predicting rectal neuroendocrine neoplasms

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 06325500

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Academic Research

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: Qatar

Manuscript submission date: 2024-08-04

Reviewer chosen by: AI Editor

Reviewer accepted review: 2024-08-06 13:44

Reviewer performed review: 2024-08-10 02:56

Review time: 3 Days and 13 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation



Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The editorial entitled “Enhancing Prognostic Accuracy in Predicting Rectal Neuroendocrine Neoplasms” (Manuscript NO: 99970) aims to discuss the importance of the GATIS score, its potential impact on clinical practice, and the strengths and limitations of the study. The GATIS score, developed from a 12-year study of 1,408 patients with rectal neuroendocrine neoplasms (R-NENs) across 17 major Chinese centers, predicts overall survival and progression-free survival more accurately than WHO grade and TNM staging. This score offers improved personalized patient management and treatment planning. However, the study includes limitations such as short follow-up durations and exclusion of molecular and genetic factors. Addressing these in future research could further enhance treatment strategies for R-NENs. This editorial explores the significance, methodology, and clinical implications of these findings. The suggestions are as follows: (1) Authors should provide an expanded form of all acronyms when they first appear, such as WHO and ROC. (2) This paragraph in the text: "In China, a subsequent analysis of 2010 gastroenteropancreatic (GEP) neuroendocrine neoplasms (NENs) cases from a nationwide retrospective multicenter



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: office@baishideng.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

study (2001-2010) found that rectal neuroendocrine neoplasms (R-NENs) accounted for 29.6% of the total. The incidence of R-NENs increased over the study period, with tumor grade correlating with metastatic involvement: 8.7% for grade 1, 16.9% for grade 2, and 17.7% for grade 3 tumors. Survival rates vary by stage and tumor grade[3].” There is an issue with the cited reference, please check if there is secondary citation issue. (3) Please consider citing relevant literature in some places to increase credibility. For example, line 104 of the text: “While previous studies have explored nomogram models for R-NENs, they often have small sample sizes and overlook preoperative hematologic factors.” (4) There are some minor errors in the references. The reference format needs to be modified according to the journal standards. (5) The language of the manuscript needs to be improved according to the journal standards.



RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastroenterology*

Manuscript NO: 99970

Title: Enhancing prognostic accuracy in predicting rectal neuroendocrine neoplasms

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 06325500

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Academic Research

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: Qatar

Manuscript submission date: 2024-08-04

Reviewer chosen by: Li Li

Reviewer accepted review: 2024-08-19 10:21

Reviewer performed review: 2024-08-19 12:04

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation



Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Round 1 ##### The editorial entitled “Enhancing Prognostic Accuracy in Predicting Rectal Neuroendocrine Neoplasms” (Manuscript NO: 99970) aims to discuss the importance of the GATIS score, its potential impact on clinical practice, and the strengths and limitations of the study. The GATIS score, developed from a 12-year study of 1,408 patients with rectal neuroendocrine neoplasms (R-NENs) across 17 major Chinese centers, predicts overall survival and progression-free survival more accurately than WHO grade and TNM staging. This score offers improved personalized patient management and treatment planning. However, the study includes limitations such as short follow-up durations and exclusion of molecular and genetic factors. Addressing these in future research could further enhance treatment strategies for R-NENs. This editorial explores the significance, methodology, and clinical implications of these findings. The suggestions are as follows: (1) Authors should provide an expanded form of all acronyms when they first appear, such as WHO and ROC. (2) This paragraph in the text: "In China, a subsequent analysis of 2010 gastroenteropancreatic (GEP) neuroendocrine neoplasms (NENs) cases from a nationwide retrospective multicenter study (2001-2010) found that rectal neuroendocrine



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: office@baishideng.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

neoplasms (R-NENs) accounted for 29.6% of the total. The incidence of R-NENs increased over the study period, with tumor grade correlating with metastatic involvement: 8.7% for grade 1, 16.9% for grade 2, and 17.7% for grade 3 tumors. Survival rates vary by stage and tumor grade[3].” There is an issue with the cited reference, please check if there is secondary citation issue. (3) Please consider citing relevant literature in some places to increase credibility. For example, line 104 of the text: “While previous studies have explored nomogram models for R-NENs, they often have small sample sizes and overlook preoperative hematologic factors.” (4) There are some minor errors in the references. The reference format needs to be modified according to the journal standards. (5) The language of the manuscript needs to be improved according to the journal standards.

Round 2 ##### The authors have addressed all my concerns. However, there is a question regarding Comment 2. In my opinion, this paragraph in the text: "In China, a subsequent analysis of 2010 gastroenteropancreatic (GEP) neuroendocrine neoplasms (NENs) cases from a nationwide retrospective multicenter study (2001-2010) found that rectal neuroendocrine neoplasms (R-NENs) accounted for 29.6% of the total. The incidence of R-NENs increased over the study period, with tumor grade correlating with metastatic involvement: 8.7% for grade 1, 16.9% for grade 2, and 17.7% for grade 3 tumors. Survival rates vary by stage and tumor grade[3].” There is secondary citation issue. Suggest the authors to read the following literature: A nation-wide retrospective epidemiological study of gastroenteropancreatic neuroendocrine neoplasms in china; PMID: 29069739, DOI: 10.18632/oncotarget.17599