



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6063

Title: Hierarchical and selective roles of galectins in hepatocarcinogenesis, liver fibrosis and inflammation

Reviewer code: 02444872

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-10-01 20:03

Date reviewed: 2013-10-12 15:57

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Cancer of liver is a worldwide disease as cancer itself. Cancer is a very heterogeneous disease involving many risk factors and multiple biochemical and signaling pathways. A lots of research efforts have been invested globally so far and still needs so on. Present review article focusses on the potential role and pathways of galectins proteins in the pathogenesis of hepatocarcinoma towards an attempt to target galectins in course of hepatocarcinoma treatment. In my opinion, authors have done a very good work in gathering and presenting critical recent findings related to up regulation of galectins-1, -3 and -4 type-, and down regulation of -lectins galectins-8 and -9 type- in pathogenesis of liver cancer. This article significantly add to the understanding of galectins involvement in development and progression of liver cancer. Introduction section needs following two clarification. 1. What are the major cell types that synthesize galectins and secrete, though, through a poorly understood pathways? 2. Are these proteins endocytosed in target cells, the hepatocytes, after binding with cell surface glycoconjugates and then transmit their signals? 3. What extent galectins are associated with carcinomas other than hepatomas? A brief paragraph needed here summarizing all galectins although specific discussion provided in respective segments. The author could better have shortened the paper had the prepared a table making comparisons on the role of various galectins in the development of hepatomas and other critical findings with references.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6063

Title: Hierarchical and selective roles of galectins in hepatocarcinogenesis, liver fibrosis and inflammation

Reviewer code: 02444965

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-10-01 20:03

Date reviewed: 2013-10-14 03:36

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the present review authors summarized current knowledge on the involvement of galectins on liver diseases. The review is very detailed, well-organized and presented critically. Its publication is appropriate as it puts together a good resource for current knowledge in the implication of the galectins, especially Galectins-1, -3, -4, -8 and -9, in the pathogenesis of liver cancer. The review is clearly written and I have only a minor comment on gene nomenclature. As indicated by HNGC Guidelines, human gene names should be written in capitalized italic characters and mouse genes in italics with capitalized first character and human proteins should be written in capitalized characters meanwhile only the first letter is capitalized in mouse proteins. I have found that the nomenclature used is confusing. As an example: - Gal1 gene (Lgals1), Page 8, 2nd paragraph. According to HNGC Guidelines it should be a mouse gene, but the 2 paragraphs following this shows results with human HCC. If referring to the human gene it should be substituted with LGALS1. Similarly to this, nomenclature should be revised all along the manuscript. In a non-exhaustive search I have found the following: - Lgals1 gene, several paragraphs in page 9. - Lgals3 gene, several paragraphs in page 16. - Lgals3 promoter, several paragraphs in page 16. - Gal4 gene (Lgals4), page 23. - Gal8 gene (Lgals8), page 24. I did not check deeply for protein nomenclature errors, but authors should do an exhaustive revision on the manuscript looking for them.