



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5971

Title: Cellular Reprogramming and Hepatocellular Carcinoma Development

Reviewer code: 00061693

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-09-30 14:10

Date reviewed: 2013-10-11 00:12

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review is (well) written by worldly-recognized experts in liver stem cells and cell reprogramming, and explores most of the features related to cellular reprogramming in liver cancer, both mechanistically but also according to potential therapies that this field can open up. My only criticism concerns the fact that the authors take it for granted that all the HCC have a stem cell component. In fact, data from mice models of targeted oncogenesis actually show that HCC can also emerge from mature hepatocytes. This seems logical as in regeneration processes, liver cells proliferate rather from mature hepatocytes than from facultative stem cells. This aspect had been very well discussed in a review from Alison et al., J Pathol 2009 and needs to be raised in this review



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5971

Title: Cellular Reprogramming and Hepatocellular Carcinoma Development

Reviewer code: 00502942

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-09-30 14:10

Date reviewed: 2013-10-14 18:24

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This paper gives concise and up-to-date review over current understanding of the genetic reprogramming for the development of hepatocellular carcinoma. I nevertheless have minor concerns over its comprehensiveness and lucidity and would like to suggest that 1. the authors may want to make supplements to the setting of HCV infection in regard to the oncogenesis, as in the case of HBV they have mentioned in the manuscript. 2. As it appears in the text, the authors give separate headings to elucidate the contents. However, to the reviewer the headings may look confusing as 'reprogramming' has been used for several times with no clear distinguishment from each other. Please make these more clearly separable. 3. I'd like to suggest to come up with a diagram for a brief summary of all possible reprogramming factors for HCC development.

ESPS Peer-review Report**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 5971**Title:** Cellular Reprogramming and Hepatocellular Carcinoma Development**Reviewer code:** 00054130**Science editor:** Cui, Xue-Mei**Date sent for review:** 2013-09-30 14:10**Date reviewed:** 2013-10-16 15:39

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript entitled "Cellular Reprogramming and Hepatocellular Carcinoma Development" is a clearly written manuscript which summarizes and discusses the existing findings on cellular reprogramming in HCC, and well describes the function of the cellular reprogramming on hepatocellular carcinoma progression. Stemness transcription factors can be induced the expression by several important ways, including DNA methylation, miRNAs, tumor microenvironments, and signaling pathways, which leads to cellular reprogramming in HCC. Reprogramming control therapy is a potential therapeutic concept, which may be a promising strategy for future HCC therapy. I only have some minor concerns and would like to suggest that: 1. Reprogramming is one of the probable reasons of generating CSC in HCC, while dedifferentiation may also lead to stemness property of cells. Please refer to a review from Chris Jopling, et al. Nature, 2011. 2. The section "CELLULAR EPROGRAMMING OF HCC" would be stronger if a recapitulative schematic was added.