



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14814

Title: Estimation of hepatic steatosis and fibrosis: Comparison of acoustic structure quantification with established non-invasive techniques

Reviewer's code: 02903629

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-10-30 08:56

Date reviewed: 2014-11-05 23:57

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I do have one question. Usually, the number of control should be more than case. But in this manuscript, the author enrolled 47 diabetic patients and 20 health controls. I believe it is easy to get more health controls.



ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14814

Title: Estimation of hepatic steatosis and fibrosis: Comparison of acoustic structure quantification with established non-invasive techniques

Reviewer’s code: 00069130

Reviewer’s country: United States

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-10-30 08:56

Date reviewed: 2014-11-25 06:36

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Thank you for the opportunity to review the manuscript submitted to WJG titled Estimation of hepatic steatosis and fibrosis: Comparison of acoustic structure quantification with established non-invasive techniques ' by Karlas T et al from Leipzig, Germany. The authors compared ultrasound-based acoustic structure quantification (ASQ) with established non-invasive techniques for grading and staging fatty liver disease. The topic is a relevant because NAFLD is perhaps the commonest liver disease and liver biopsy although the 'gold standard' is associated with several problems like mortality, inter-observer variability and sampling errors. It is therefore very important to look into non-invasive methods. Biomarkers such as CK-18, TNF-a, AST/ALT, platelet count, adipokines etc are unfortunately unreliable. Here authors compared transient elastography (TE), controlled attenuation parameter (CAP), nuclear magnetic resonance spectroscopy and ASQ. The problem with this approach is the lack of comparison with the 'so called' gold standard namely liver biopsy. The authors claim that this study provides first evidence that ASQ focal disturbance (FD) ratio can be used for non-invasive evaluation of hepatic steatosis in patients at risk for fatty liver



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

disease. However, this claim needs further evaluation by other groups globally. Overall, this is a well written manuscript which may be considered for publication in WJG.