



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 53335

Title: The Gut Microbiota in Primary Sclerosing Cholangitis: A review

Reviewer's code: 04091933

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Associate Professor, Senior Researcher

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Russia

Author's Country/Territory: Canada

Manuscript submission date: 2019-12-30

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-12-30 21:52

Reviewer performed review: 2020-01-03 21:03

Review time: 3 Days and 23 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The topic of the review is very relevant. In general, the review deserves publication, but only after a major revision. Some very important studies are not mentioned, e.g. study by Rühlemann M. et al., 2019, suggesting that PSC itself drives the faecal microbiota changes. In the section on microbial metabolites, information is presented incorrectly and abounds with general phrases (both for bile acids and for SCFAs) that are not related to PSC. The practically unused and misleading term 'Endobiome' is not referenced. Phrases that 'the Gram-negative bacteria, BSH has only been identified for *Bacteroides fragilis*' (all *Bacteroides* spp., and some other Gram-negative bacteria, such as *Alistipes*, *Fusobacteria*, etc., are BSH containing!) and that 'The process of dehydroxylation ... found only in anaerobic gut bacteria, mainly *Clostridium* (clusters XIVa and IX) and *Eubacterium* of the Firmicutes phylum' (not *Clostridium* genus, but clostridial clusters!) are outdated and incorrect. Only one no longer relevant reference for BAs is given (Wahlstrom A. et al., 2016). It is recommended that you either omit this information or update it. Changes in the gut microbiome in PSC are recommended to be presented in the table. It is desirable (but not necessary) to add a figure reflecting the role of the gut microbiome and its changes in PSC.



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 53335

Title: The Gut Microbiota in Primary Sclerosing Cholangitis: A review

Reviewer's code: 03202427

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Associate Professor, Director

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: Canada

Manuscript submission date: 2019-12-30

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-12-31 02:46

Reviewer performed review: 2020-01-04 08:19

Review time: 4 Days and 5 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. The title reflect the main subject/hypothesis of the manuscript. 2 The abstract summarize and reflect the work described in the manuscript. 3 The key words reflect the focus of the manuscript. 4 The manuscript adequately describe the background, present status and significance of the study. 5 The manuscript interpret the findings adequately and appropriately, highlighting the key points concisely, clearly and logically. The findings and their applicability/relevance to the literature stated in a clear and definite manner. The discussion accurate and discuss the paper's scientific significance and/or relevance to clinical practice sufficient. 6 The manuscript meet the requirements of use of SI units. 7 The manuscript cite appropriately the latest, important and authoritative references in the introduction and discussion sections. 8 The manuscript well, concisely and coherently organized and presented. The style, language and grammar are accurate and appropriate. 9 The author prepare the manuscript according to the appropriate research methods and reporting?



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 53335

Title: The Gut Microbiota in Primary Sclerosing Cholangitis: A review

Reviewer's code: 02439547

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Doctor, Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: Canada

Manuscript submission date: 2019-12-30

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-01-04 07:49

Reviewer performed review: 2020-01-07 13:49

Review time: 3 Days and 5 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This paper focuses on the possible mechanisms about gut microbiome and its metabolites in primary sclerosing cholangitis (PSC) and PSC-IBD, especially the role of bile acids, which provides potential target for clinical treatment of PSC. And an expanded knowledge of the gut microbiome as it relates to PSC offers critical insight into the development of microbe-altering therapeutic interventions, such as antibiotics, nutritional interventions and fecal microbial transplantation.. The author reviews the literature comprehensively. However, there are a few English spelling mistakes in this paper.