



ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 25856

Title: Light and sound – emerging imaging techniques for inflammatory bowel disease

Reviewer’s code: 03567375

Reviewer’s country: France

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2016-03-25 15:50

Date reviewed: 2016-04-06 01:32

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Comments to Authors This is a very interesting and exhaustive review of imaging techniques for IBD, focusing on their potential for initial diagnosis, assessment of disease activity and surveillance of dysplasia and cancer. Comments Pages 12-13 : The authors could insist on the accuracy of confocal laser endomicroscopy for assessing mucosal healing in IBD (Mace V et al., J Gastroenterol Hepatol 2015), and intraepithelial neoplasia (Sharma P, Gastrointest Endosc 2011). The authors could also cite and comment on a very recent paper by Haas K et al (World J Radiol 2016) on the current imaging guidelines in pediatric and adult IBD patients. The text should be checked for typos (including page 3, “core tip”, lines 1 and 5; page 11 paragraph “ultrasound molecular imagining” line 5 ; pages 13 and 14, second paragraphs (patterns ; dyes) ; page 15, second paragraph lines 4, 8, 11 ; page 15 second-last line..).

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 25856

Title: Light and sound – emerging imaging techniques for inflammatory bowel disease

Reviewer’s code: 00036328

Reviewer’s country: Italy

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2016-03-25 15:50

Date reviewed: 2016-04-07 02:08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Light and sound – emerging imaging techniques for inflammatory bowel disease from Knieling & Waldner is an extensive review about endoscopic and ultrasound techniques for the evaluation of patients affected by inflammatory bowel disease. Many technologies listed in the review are not widely available even in IBD specialized tertiary centers. Moreover, some technologies are not proved to be useful for diagnostic or surveillance purposes. So that this review seems to be a mere list of technologies applicable for a lot of intestinal diseases. It would be useful to read in the different paragraphs on what occasion in IBD each technology could be applied, to have a more in-depth analysis of the various arguments. For example, the search for granuloma formation in Crohn’s disease is a challenging question. In the major part of cases CD is not diagnosed on the basis of granuloma finding, and microscopic endoscopic technologies unlikely may improve the diagnosis. The paragraphs ‘Clinical evidence and translation of endoscopic techniques’ and ‘Clinical evidence and translation of ultrasound techniques’ seem an oversimplification and are difficult to read. It is stated that the new techniques are useful for surveillance and detection of dysplasia in IBD. I agree for this statement, but the new techniques are equally important in finding colon cancer in IBD,



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

especially in cases with a large number of pseudopolyps. I believe that the figures 1 and 2 do not add anything to the work and should be removed. Table 1, Recommendations and state-of-the-art in IBD imaging. As it is, the statements included in the table are not acceptable. For each statement a reference should be added. The text should be checked for typographical errors.