



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5906

Title: Immune, metabolic and genetic factors in hepatitis C virus infection

Reviewer code: 00502973

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-09-29 17:07

Date reviewed: 2013-10-28 23:21

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this manuscript, Fierro et al reviewed the correlation of lipid metabolism and HCV infection and the potential targets to develop new therapies against HCV. This is an interesting review. However, some concerns need to be addressed before it can be accepted for publication. The major concern is that many references in this review are outdated and new information should be incorporated in this manuscript. Specific concerns: 1. In the section of "1.1. Innate and adaptive immune response to HCV": CD4+ T cell is a heterogenous population, and is consisted of a variety of cell types, e.g. Th1, Th2, Th17, Treg cells. These cell types play different roles in vivo. The author should discriminate the effects of these distinct cells rather than mention them as a whole. 2. In the section of "1.2. Neutralizing antibodies": The abbreviation should be spelt out at the site where it is first present in the manuscript, e.g. HVR. 3. In the section of "1.3. Mechanisms of immune evasion by HCV": The author wrote "Genetic analysis reveals a positive correlation between distinct HCV quasispecies, viral clearance and a slowly adapting viral population, ..." I think using "close correlation" is better than "positive correlation" as not all these factors are POSITIVELY corrected. 4. In the section of "2.1. HCV entry": The first sentence is "After this discovery, HCV was found associated to lipoproteins." I cannot understand what is "this discovery". The author should indicate what the discovery is before this statement. Also in this paragraph, the author wrote "LVPs contain HCV-RNA and the totality of the structural viral proteins, mainly E1 y E2 responsible for assembly of the virus with the hepatocyte; LVPs are also rich in triglycerides [6, 43]." I cannot understand this sentence. I also don't think E1 and E2 can assemble HCV virus with hepatocytes. "LVPs are also rich in triglycerides [6, 43]." is a duplicate statement of the previous sentence "These particles also recognized as lipoviroparticles (LVP) are rich in triglycerides...", and should be deleted. 5. In the section of "2.2. HCV replication,



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

virion assembly and secretion: role of ApoB and MTP": The last sentence of the 1st paragraph, the author stated "Understanding the components involved in this process will allow the design of specific therapeutic targets." I am not so sure about this statement. I suggest this sentence changes to "...will allow the possible design of ...". In the 2nd paragraph of this section, the author stated "According to clinical data and experimental models, the HCV core protein has been shown to inhibit the MTP protein." The author should provide references to support this statement. 6. In the section of "2.3. Mechanism of HCV-associated steatosis": The knowledge in this section is generally outdated. New discoveries should be included, e.g. *Hepatology*. 2013 Jul 29. doi: 10.1002/hep.26634., *Bioorg Med Chem Lett*. 2013 Sep 1;23(17):4774-8., *Hepatology*. 2013 Jun 14. doi: 10.1002/hep.26566., *Obesity (Silver Spring)*. 2012 Jul;20(7):1474-80. doi: 10.1038/oby.2012.45., *Hepatology*. 2013 Apr;57(4):1394-406. doi: 10.1002/hep.26225., *J Hepatol*. 2013 Nov;59(5):942-8. doi: 10.1016/j.jhep.2013.06.025., *PLoS One*. 2013 May 31;8(5):e64932. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0064932., et al. 7. In the last paragraph of page 9: The author stated "Recent reports demonstrate that HCV infection enhances the proteolytic cleavage of SREBP precursors in hepatic cells." The only references in this paragraph are Ref. 89 and 90. These 2 reports were published in 2008 and 2005 respectively. I don't think these two publications are "recent reports". Also in page 11, the 2nd paragraph, the author stated "Recent studies have demonstrated the presence of...", yet the reference was published 10 years ago, and cannot be regarded as "recent study". And the last paragraph of page 11, "A recent analysis reveals that pathologies associated to high levels of cholesterol represent one of the eight main risk f



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5906

Title: Immune, metabolic and genetic factors in hepatitis C virus infection

Reviewer code: 02446172

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-09-29 17:07

Date reviewed: 2013-12-23 19:08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this paper the authors have discussed the correlation of lipid metabolism and HCV infection. This is a well-written article but I have some corrections. 1.The abbreviations should be spelt out at the site where it is first present in the article. For example,in the page 6,2.2 MTP 2.Page 9,line 2, upre-regulating 3.Page 11, line 7: Recent studies; which studies? References should be written. 4.In references, spaces should be corrected.