



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 32585

Title: Phase I study of personalized peptide vaccination combined with radiotherapy for advanced hepatocellular carcinoma patients

Reviewer's code: 03253495

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2017-01-16 14:17

Date reviewed: 2017-01-16 22:28

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Interesting study. I suggest to accept it in the current form.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 32585

Title: Phase I study of personalized peptide vaccination combined with radiotherapy for advanced hepatocellular carcinoma patients

Reviewer's code: 02541391

Reviewer's country: Romania

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2017-01-16 14:17

Date reviewed: 2017-01-23 05:14

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The present study "Phase I study personalized peptide vaccination combined with radiotherapy for advanced hepatocellular carcinoma patients" includes a total of nine patients. Usually, the phase I study includes a small sample size (20 to 100, typically around 20). Despite the small number of patients included in the present study (nine patients with advanced hepatocellular carcinoma), it is interesting. The title reflects the contents of the manuscript. The structure is good and concise. However, the manuscript requires a number of corrections: "7 patients with multiple liver metastases (liver lesions >3 pieces), 1 patient with portal vein tumor thrombosis, 1 patient with bone metastasis, 3 patients with lung metastasis, and 1 patients with peritoneal metastasis" (Seven patients with multiple liver metastases.....).



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 32585

Title: Phase I study of personalized peptide vaccination combined with radiotherapy for advanced hepatocellular carcinoma patients

Reviewer's code: 03647881

Reviewer's country: Taiwan

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2017-01-16 14:17

Date reviewed: 2017-02-07 15:56

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this paper, Jie Shen, et al. reported "Phase I study of personalized peptide vaccination combined with radiotherapy for advanced hepatocellular carcinoma patients". The issue proposed by the authors is an important and potential method in the future but some methodological shortcoming and the design should be clearly exposed. Following some comments:

2. PATIENTS AND METHODS 2.1 Patients " -----In which, 7 patients with multiple metastases?" This sentence was not clear. 2.2.1 Radiotherapy In your team, what criteria decide patient accepting treatment strategies including dosage and duration? 3 Results 1. This study presented therapeutic benefit for HCC patients; however, important laboratory data, for example bilirubin and albumin, need to be described because they could affect patient survival. 2. According to author, no significant adverse event was in this study. Why the patient 9 didn't continue treatment? 3. Different virus etiologies could induce different levels of immune response and clinical result; therefore, they need to be mentioned in the following study. Thanks!