



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14713

Title: A Review on Immunosuppression in Liver Transplantation

Reviewer's code: 02521203

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Xiu-Xia Song

Date sent for review: 2014-10-21 11:39

Date reviewed: 2014-10-27 02:47

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript is a comprehensive review on the liver transplantation. It is well written and authors have done a good job in summarizing vast information; good balance of the four sections. They also give interesting comments at the end of almost every section. A good introduction of immunosuppression in LT, authors have included enough background for readers. Up to date references were discussed in the following sections. Drugs used to maintain immunosuppression in LT; In specific subpopulations; Maintenance of IS. Minor comments: Typos: paragraph beginning with In the trial by Klintmalm et al, should be "receiving", and in the same "trial". Specific comments: 1. Paragraph beginning "The other clinical utility of mTORIs...", The following statement is not exactly correct, "Everolimus is the only mTORI that is approved for cancer treatment in advanced HCC". The referred study is only a review stating phase II clinical trial suggesting it has activity in HCC, not an approved drug in HCC. In fact, a recent study [<http://jama.jamanetwork.com/article.aspx?articleid=1884577>] concluded that everolimus did not improve OS in patients with advanced HCC whose disease progressed on or after sorafenib or who were sorafenib intolerant." 2. Table1, include references for the agents would be very useful to the



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

reader. 3. Authors should discuss pediatric LT as one of the subpopulations. Very little was discussed on this. 4. In certain part of the review, only listing sparse sentences of evidence, author should better organized and synthesized the contents and make meaningful discussion for these sections. 5. In the final summary section, author gave an interesting concept of individualized immunosuppression for patients receiving liver transplantation, however, they should elaborate more on this suggestion, by providing insights or speculations what strategies one can use to customize the regime. Overall, though, I found this to be a comprehensive review.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14713

Title: A Review on Immunosuppression in Liver Transplantation

Reviewer's code: 00506409

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Xiu-Xia Song

Date sent for review: 2014-10-21 11:39

Date reviewed: 2014-11-15 22:29

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting and very comprehensive review on immunosuppressants for liver transplantation. The authors cover the topic in four main sections: induction immunosuppression, maintenance immunosuppression, immunosuppression in specific liver transplantation populations, and monitoring of the immune status. The review is well written and the messages are clear. The Table is informative and the figure forms a nice illustration. This manuscript will attract interest from readers in liver transplant clinics. There are a few suggestions to further improve the manuscript. These are given in 31 comments, in the attached pdf file of the manuscript.