



# BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 29465

**Title:** Novel CagA ELISA exhibits enhanced sensitivity of Helicobacter pylori CagA antibody

**Reviewer's code:** 01436291

**Reviewer's country:** Italy

**Science editor:** Jing Yu

**Date sent for review:** 2016-08-16 16:45

**Date reviewed:** 2016-08-24 01:43

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

These researchers determined the presence and the levels of anti-CagA antibodies in two groups of patients, one infected by H. pylori strains with East Asian-type CagA, the other one with Western type CagA. The gold standard for the H. pylori infectious status was endoscopy with rapid urease test, biopsy culture, histological tests confirmed by immunohistochemistry and detection of serum antibodies to whole H. pylori antigens. They observed that ELISA using East Asian-type CagA had greater sensitivity with patients infected by strains expressing East Asian CagA; in addition, the levels of anti-CagA antibodies in these patients tended to correlate with histologic chronic inflammation score. This study is important, since it partly solve a main problem of H. pylori and CagA serology, sensitivity. The manuscript is written in good English and is very clear. I only have one criticism: the authors failed to report the characteristics of the cagA variable region of H. pylori organism providing the CagA protein used to develop the kit for CagA antibodies. Did the authors presume that Genesis Diagnostics Ltd use a western strain or did they characterize the cagA polymorphism of the Genesis Diagnostics Ltd strain? The authors examined the cagA variable region



## BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

---

of the eastern strain used to produce a eastern type CagA; similarly, I think they should provide evidences that the western strain really harbor a western type CagA.



# BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 29465

**Title:** Novel CagA ELISA exhibits enhanced sensitivity of Helicobacter pylori CagA antibody

**Reviewer's code:** 00505471

**Reviewer's country:** India

**Science editor:** Jing Yu

**Date sent for review:** 2016-08-16 16:45

**Date reviewed:** 2016-09-14 15:09

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

It is a useful paper on an important topic. However, I have the following comments: 1. All sections of the paper are excessively long. Thus the important message of the paper is lost. 2. Some sections require rewriting since they are not clear, e.g. lines 196-9. 3. In the results section there is a lot of material which actually refers to methodology, e.g. lines 305-16. These should be re positioned accordingly. 4. there is a lot of discussion included in the results section. Results should refer only data generated by the study and abstain from drawing inferences or discussing it. 5. Discussions section is too long and thus the important issues get lost in unnecessary detail. It should be short and crisp. 6. The most important message of the paper is that since there is regional variation in CaGA, ELISA for detection of CaGA should use multiple sera so that sensitivity can be increased. This fact is not sufficiently emphasized. 7. Overall there are problems in language which require to be addressed to make the manuscript more readable.