



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4745

Title: Increased bone mineral density in patients with non-alcoholic steatohepatitis

Reviewer code: 01810503

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-07-22 19:45

Date reviewed: 2013-07-23 04:50

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this manuscript Muhsin Kaya et al. report that NASH patients exhibit a higher bone mineral density than healthy controls. The authors can not confirm elevated serum levels of cytokines, such as TNF-alpha and IL-6 or downregulated IGF-1 as independent prognostic markers for NASH. Interestingly, though, they observe elevated 25-OH-vitamin D3 levels in NASH patients. The manuscript is interesting. Still, some important points need to be raised. - A severe drawback of the study is that the authors fail to cite recent relevant papers on 25-OH-vitamin D3 and liver disease, such as Barchetta et al. Hepatology 2012 or Eliades et al. Alimentary Pharmacology and Therapeutics, 2013 - In fact, these reports rather suggest no or even an inverse relationship of 25-OH-vitamin D3 and NASH. - The authors also fail to mention recent data from the literature on bone mineral density and NAFLD, e.g. Pacifico World J Gastroenterol 2013 or Purnak et al. Wiener Klinische Wochenschrift 2012 - The authors report how the insulin resistance index was determined. Still, I can not find the clinical values for the investigated subjects. - Such a study requires that glucose and insulin levels are shown. In fact, overexpression of IGF2-binding protein IGF2BP2 was shown to induce NAFLD (Tybl et al. J Hepatol 2011). - What were the reference values for all determined parameters? When are IGF-1 levels "decreased", when TNF-alpha "increased", etc.? These reference values have to be given for all parameters measured.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4745

Title: Increased bone mineral density in patients with non-alcoholic steatohepatitis

Reviewer code: 01555260

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-07-22 19:45

Date reviewed: 2013-07-24 18:01

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Since you entered patients of very low histopathological disease, it seems to me that you better use NAFLD instead of NASH as the terminology for your patients' disease. Moreover, when you use something is lower than another, it must be statistically significant, unless you should especially say that (but the significance level was not achieved): discussion: iPTH.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4745

Title: Increased bone mineral density in patients with non-alcoholic steatohepatitis

Reviewer code: 00071662

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-07-22 19:45

Date reviewed: 2013-07-24 21:21

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Minor revisions needed in language Interesting idea