

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

ESPS manuscript NO: 28139

Title: Case of severe alcoholic hepatitis treated with granulocytapheresis

Reviewer's code: 02514886

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2016-06-29 10:52

Date reviewed: 2016-06-30 16:01

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this invited short article, Dr. Watanabe, and Dr. Kamimura together with their colleagues describe their clinical experience in applying granulocytapheresis to treat a severe case of alcoholic hepatitis. Given that the treatment does not involve any drug, the therapeutic outcome is intriguing. I have only minor comments, which if addressed should significantly add to the impact of this very interesting report.

1. Please write GMA instead of GCAP. GMA should come after granulocyte and monocyte apheresis (GMA). Please see the reference by Saniabadi, et al. I have recommended below.
2. You have adequately described the clinicopathological features of alcoholic hepatitis, but the readers of your paper may need to know more on how GMA works in this clinical setting. Please add this short paragraph to your Discussion section and cite the reference provided below. The clinical efficacy seen following a course of GMA therapy is unlikely to be due to the depletion of myeloid lineage leucocytes per se. There are multiple lines of evidence for GMA induced immune modulation. As reviewed recently (cite new reference here please), the myeloid leucocytes, which adsorb to the GMA carries in the Adacolumn release several substances, which appear in the GMA column outflow blood that returns to the patients. Thus, the column outflow blood shows a significant level



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

of soluble TNF receptors I and II known to neutralize TNF without invoking TNF-like actions, IL-1 receptor antagonist (IL-1ra) and hepatocyte growth factor (HGF). IL-1ra is known to block the actions of IL-1, while HGF is known to promote cell regeneration, an essential step in healing of the damaged liver. Saniabadi AR, Tanaka T, Ohmori T, Sawada K, Yamamoto T, Hanai H. Treating inflammatory bowel disease by adsorptive leucocytapheresis: a desire to treat without drugs. *World J Gastroenterol.* 2014;20:9699-715. doi: 10.3748/wjg.v20.i29.9699. PMID: 25110409 3. Your report needs minor language editing. For example, in your core tip and elsewhere, the text says: Corticosteroid (CS) has shown its effectiveness treating patients by prohibiting the production of cytokines. Prohibiting is not a correct term here. The sentence should read like this: Corticosteroids (CS) have shown efficacy in patients with alcoholic hepatitis by inhibiting the production of cytokines.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

ESPS manuscript NO: 28139

Title: Case of severe alcoholic hepatitis treated with granulocytapheresis

Reviewer's code: 01323395

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2016-06-29 10:52

Date reviewed: 2016-07-04 14:37

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> [] Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> [] The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [] Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [] Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting and weel written case report.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

ESPS manuscript NO: 28139

Title: Case of severe alcoholic hepatitis treated with granulocytapheresis

Reviewer's code: 00051227

Reviewer's country: Poland

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2016-06-29 10:52

Date reviewed: 2016-07-07 14:15

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper reports a potentially interesting and important study. Overall, the paper is clear and well written. The presented data are easy to understand. However, the manuscript has few important errors. Specific comments: 1. Authors wrote "(...) He (patient) had been a heavy drinker for about 10 years, and consumed approximately 250 mg of alcohol per day (...)". It seems to me that patient consumed 250 g of alcohol per day (but not 250 mg), if he had been a heavy drinker. 2. Figure 1 a. For unknown reason data regarding CRP are repeated twice. Moreover, there are some inconsistency between the data presented in text and in Figure 1a. For instance: in text CRP = 3.97 mg/dl but in Fig. CRP = 6.73 mg/dl. Please compare/check other parameters presented in text and in Figure 1 a. 3. Some abbreviations are missing.