



ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 17761

Title: Indocyanine green kinetics to assess liver function: Ready for a clinical dynamic assessment in major liver surgery?

Reviewer's code: 02861019

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2015-03-25 19:18

Date reviewed: 2015-03-25 23:33

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT | CONCLUSION |
|---|--|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor | | <input type="checkbox"/> No | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | BPG Search: | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> No | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear Editor, I really appreciate the complete and precise review entitled "Indocyanine green (ICG) kinetics to assess liver function : ready for a clinical dynamic assessment in major liver surgery ?" in which Dr. Andrea DeGasperi et al. clearly describe all (recent and not) evidences of clinical applications of ICG clearaance. My first observation is the great quality of the entire manuscript; in my poor opinion, the entire manuscript is quite long and could be shortened in order to highlight recent clinical application. Based on my clinical experience (as hepatologist and not as surgeon) I suggest to include also a chapter on the application of ICG clearance and ICG 15' retention test in patients with compensated and decompensated cirrhosis; since most of post-surgical decompensation are due to the underlying presence of portal hypertension and parenchymal dysfunction, ICG-based non-invasive diagnosis of clinically significant portal hypertension, severe portal hypertension and esophageal varices in patients with compensated disease is a key issue [Lisotti A et al. Hepatology 2014; Zipprich A et al. Gut 2010; Stauber RE et al. Liver Int 2009].



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 17761

Title: Indocyanine green kinetics to assess liver function: Ready for a clinical dynamic assessment in major liver surgery?

Reviewer's code: 00069693

Reviewer's country: Brazil

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2015-03-25 19:18

Date reviewed: 2015-04-22 10:28

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT | CONCLUSION |
|---|--|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | <input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | <input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | <input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor | | <input type="checkbox"/> [Y] No | <input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision |
| | | BPG Search: | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> [Y] No | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors write properly and completely clinical applications resulting from the indocyanine green kinetics (ICG) in the evaluation of liver function, especially with regard to its application in major liver surgery. However, for an article that concludes that are needed controlled and randomized clinical trials to incorporate this test in clinical practice, the authors could reduce the article content, removing some technical data detailing the kinetic of ICG. I suggest to the authors provide the technical data only necessary for the understanding of the potential clinical utility of the test.