Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568
**E-mail:** office@baishideng.com
**https**://www.wjgnet.com

# PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** *World Journal of Transplantation*

**Manuscript NO:** 92335

**Title:** Impact of bisphosphonate treatment on bone mineral density after kidney transplant

**Provenance and peer review**: Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

**Peer-review model:** Single blind

**Reviewer's code:** 07805720
**Position:** Peer Reviewer
**Academic degree:** PhD

**Professional title:** Academic Research, Assistant Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Türkiye

**Author's Country/Territory:** Greece

**Manuscript submission date:** 2024-01-22

**Reviewer chosen by:** AI Technique

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2024-01-23 07:37

**Reviewer performed review:** 2024-01-26 22:54

**Review time:** 3 Days and 15 Hours

| | |
|---|---|
| **Scientific quality** | [ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Very good [Y] Grade C: Good<br>[ ] Grade D: Fair [ ] Grade E: Do not publish |
| **Novelty of this manuscript** | [ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Good [Y] Grade C: Fair<br>[ ] Grade D: No novelty |
| **Creativity or innovation of this manuscript** | [ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Good [Y] Grade C: Fair<br>[ ] Grade D: No creativity or innovation |

Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568
**E-mail:** office@baishideng.com
**https**://www.wjgnet.com

| | |
|---|---|
| **Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript** | [ ] Grade A: Excellent [ Y] Grade B: Good [ ] Grade C: Fair [ ] Grade D: No scientific significance |
| **Language quality** | [ Y] Grade A: Priority publishing [ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing [ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [ ] Grade D: Rejection |
| **Conclusion** | [ ] Accept (High priority) [ ] Accept (General priority) [ Y] Minor revision [ ] Major revision [ ] Rejection |
| **Re-review** | [ ] Yes [ Y] No |
| **Peer-reviewer statements** | Peer-Review: [ Y] Anonymous [ ] Onymous |
| | Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [ Y] No |

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I have read the manuscript and would like to thank the authors for their work. Although there are publications in the literature on the use of bisphosphonates or new groups of drugs that increase bone density in kidney transplant patients, there is still a need for studies on the long-term effects and safety of these drugs. Therefore, although the study has limitations, it is important. Best regards • It may be appropriate to write down the dosage of the medications. “In this study, only weekly or monthly preparations of orally administered bisphosphonates were used and no serious adverse effects were recorded.” • Since ibandronic acid is contraindicated in hypocalcemia, have patients been checked for the presence/absence of this condition during 4 years of the treatment? (Even calcium and vitamin D are given to patients) • As the authors stated in the limitations of the study, studies on the effectiveness and long-term safety of bisphosphonates should be conducted by increasing the number of patients and determining control groups and subgroups. • Minor corrections: o Line 37: BMD improved significantly in those who received bisphosphonates… o Line 39: follow-up o Line 48: Keywords o Line 59: end-stage o Line 83, 120, 165: instead of “per os”, you may use “orally” o Line 111:

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568
**E-mail:** office@baishideng.com
**https**://www.wjgnet.com

instead of “bone mineral density” use the abb “BMD” o Line 112: ….T score (in the whole text) o Line 167: …ibandronic acid… o Line 216: instead of “on the whole”, I suggest using “overall” • Here are current publications for discussion: o Dabbaghmanesh, A., Bakhshayeshkaram, M., Roshanzamir, S., Naseri, A., Dabbaghmanesh, M. M., Heydari, S. T., Talehzadeh, P., Dabbaghmanesh, M. H., & Jahromi, S. E. (2023). The effect of zoledronic acid on hip geometry in renal transplant recipients: a double-blind placebo-controlled randomized study. BMC nephrology, 24(1), 331. https://doi.org/10.1186/s12882-023-03376-y o Leng, Y., Yu, X., Yang, Y., & Xia, Y. (2023). Efficacy and safety of medications for osteoporosis in kidney transplant recipients or patients with chronic kidney disease: A meta-analysis. Journal of investigative medicine : the official publication of the American Federation for Clinical Research, 71(7), 760–772. https://doi.org/10.1177/10815589231184215 o Uçar, Z. A., Sinangil, A., Koç, Y., Barlas, I. S., Ecder, S. T., & Akin, E. B. (2022). The Effect of Alendronate on Bone Mineral Disorder in Renal Transplant Patients. Transplantation proceedings, 54(3), 658–662. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.transproceed.2022.01.016 • For discussion: “The effect of denosumab was greater compared with that of bisphosphonate treatment” o McKee, H., Ioannidis, G., Lau, A., Treleaven, D., Gangji, A., Ribic, C., Wong-Pack, M., Papaioannou, A., & Adachi, J. D. (2020). Comparison of the clinical effectiveness and safety between the use of denosumab vs bisphosphonates in renal transplant patients. Osteoporosis international : a journal established as result of cooperation between the European Foundation for Osteoporosis and the National Osteoporosis Foundation of the USA, 31(5), 973–980. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00198-019-05267-1

Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568
**E-mail:** office@baishideng.com
**https**://www.wjgnet.com

# PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** *World Journal of Transplantation*

**Manuscript NO:** 92335

**Title:** Impact of bisphosphonate treatment on bone mineral density after kidney transplant

**Provenance and peer review**: Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

**Peer-review model:** Single blind

**Reviewer's code:** 02726701
**Position:** Editorial Board
**Academic degree:** MD
**Professional title:** Professor
**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Chile
**Author's Country/Territory:** Greece

**Manuscript submission date:** 2024-01-22

**Reviewer chosen by:** AI Technique

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2024-01-23 23:39

**Reviewer performed review:** 2024-01-27 16:25

**Review time:** 3 Days and 16 Hours

| | |
|---|---|
| **Scientific quality** | [ ] Grade A: Excellent [Y] Grade B: Very good [ ] Grade C: Good<br>[ ] Grade D: Fair [ ] Grade E: Do not publish |
| **Novelty of this manuscript** | [ ] Grade A: Excellent [Y] Grade B: Good [ ] Grade C: Fair<br>[ ] Grade D: No novelty |
| **Creativity or innovation of this manuscript** | [ ] Grade A: Excellent [Y] Grade B: Good [ ] Grade C: Fair<br>[ ] Grade D: No creativity or innovation |

Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568
**E-mail:** office@baishideng.com
**https**://www.wjgnet.com

| | |
|---|---|
| **Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript** | [ ] Grade A: Excellent [ Y] Grade B: Good [ ] Grade C: Fair [ ] Grade D: No scientific significance |
| **Language quality** | [ Y] Grade A: Priority publishing [ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing [ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [ ] Grade D: Rejection |
| **Conclusion** | [ ] Accept (High priority) [ ] Accept (General priority) [ Y] Minor revision [ ] Major revision [ ] Rejection |
| **Re-review** | [ Y] Yes [ ] No |
| **Peer-reviewer statements** | Peer-Review: [ Y] Anonymous [ ] Onymous |
| | Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [ Y] No |

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Comments on Impact of bisphosphonate treatment on bone mineral density after kidney transplant The manuscript is well organized and written. I have no comments about its contents. Nevertheless, I think it lacks some approach to the source problem it is addressing: The pathophysiology of post kidney transplantation osteopenia/osteoporosis has a well-known metabolic bone disease in the patient before the transplantation that obeys to several factors, mainly low levels of 1,25(OH)2-Vit D3, high PTH and FGF-23, calcium/phosphate levels, chronic inflammation and concomitant therapies intended to ameliorate those abnormalities. Georgopoulou el al. described that bone mineral density (BMD) increased in concomitance of biphosphonate use and this surrogate marker of bone fractures could be desirable for transplantation teams. I agree, but, please, calculate and comment how many patients have to be treated to reduce clinical fractures rates. In reference 10 (JASN. 1998 Apr; (4):677-83) it is described that 10-26% of kidney transplant recipients develop a bone fracture, figure that seems exaggerated in comparison with less than 3% from another cite (Transplantation . 2016 Jan;100(1):167-75. doi: 10.1097/TP.0000000000000808). Tables, graphs and abstract

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568
**E-mail:** office@baishideng.com
**https**://www.wjgnet.com

sections are ok. Please, edit reference section in AMA format.