



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 23878

Title: Liver cancer stem cell markers: progression and therapeutic implications

Reviewer's code: 00053659

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2015-12-22 15:34

Date reviewed: 2015-12-23 14:44

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Sun J et al. reviewed stem cell markers for liver cancer. Overall manuscript is well written, but it needs additional figure for supporting the text. In the section 2, the marker list does not consistent with the order of the Table. In the section 3, additional figure should be presented for understanding the hierarchy of the cancer stem cells. In the section 3, the knowledge from basic research and clinical research should be divided in order to make them clear. Squares are spreading everywhere. Please use proper font.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 23878

Title: Liver cancer stem cell markers: progression and therapeutic implications

Reviewer's code: 00013146

Reviewer's country: United Kingdom

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2015-12-22 15:34

Date reviewed: 2016-01-12 17:46

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review article provides a good overview of cancer stem cell markers in HCC. 1. As alluded to in the Introduction, the cell of origin of HCC remains uncertain. Although, there is one school of thought, which suggests that all HCCs are derived from progenitor cells, there are also studies suggesting that HCCs may be derived from mature hepatocytes. In the latter scenario, features of "stemness" may represent de-differentiation rather than cell of origin. Although a consideration of HCC histogenesis is not the main aim of this review article, some consideration of this issue might nevertheless be appropriate. 2. Some of the markers discussed (e.g. CD44, ICAM-1) appear to have properties primarily associated with more aggressive behaviour rather than specifically being features of "stemness." 3. No mention is made of biliary epithelial markers such as CK7 or CK19, which are often used as markers of a progenitor cell phenotype in HCC