



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 26811

Title: Dangerous dietary supplements: Garcinia cambogia-associated hepatic failure requiring transplantation

Reviewer's code: 03195661

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2016-04-27 11:42

Date reviewed: 2016-05-03 09:50

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors present a very interesting and important finding in a case of Garcinia cambogia-associated hepatic failure. The story is well organized and clearly presented. The effect of Garcinia cambogia on acute or chronic liver damage should be reviewed more clearly in the discussion section.



ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 26811

Title: Dangerous dietary supplements: Garcinia cambogia-associated hepatic failure requiring transplantation

Reviewer’s code: 03536082

Reviewer’s country: Poland

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2016-04-27 11:42

Date reviewed: 2016-05-17 19:19

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript entitled "Dangerous dietary supplements: Garcinia cambogia - associated hepatic failure requiring transplantation" has interesting information about case of hepatic failure associated with the Garcinia cambogia. Currently, dietary supplements marketed for weight loss are very popular. One such preparation (Garcinia cambogia) is illustrated in the manuscript. However, there is no information about the amount of supplement consumed per day (exactly what means: "he imbibed high daily doses of the supplement for five months"?) and about manufacturer’s recommendations. It is very important fact as there is no confirmation of a dependence between an applied dose and a toxic effect. In the literature there are various examples of with the use of relatively high doses of this supplement in human obesity when the author did not observe any health risks. One active ingredient in this supplement is hydroxycitric acid. The authors did not specific its content in the formulation (lack of detailed composition).

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 26811

Title: Dangerous dietary supplements: Garcinia cambogia-associated hepatic failure requiring transplantation

Reviewer's code: 02500867

Reviewer's country: Turkey

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2016-04-27 11:42

Date reviewed: 2016-05-31 20:42

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The MANUSCRIPT can be accepted with a minor revision given below: The following is taken from the Discussion section of the Manuscript : "Conditions predisposing patients to liver toxicity associated with Garcinia cambogia and like products remain unidentified. Acute liver failure from supplement ingestion appears relatively rare compared to their widespread use. Certain patients may have genetic predisposition or existing liver damage compounding hepatotoxicity.

" Revise the following section by giving more information on Author's example... "for example, weight-loss supplements containing N-nitrofenfluramine affected patients exhibiting specific phenotypes of cytochrome CYP2C19 [21]. " Revision : Lunsford et al., may discuss in a better way results of the following paper they cited in the manuscript (Reference 21) "Such as one of the patients who was poor metabolizer and two patients who were extensive metabolizers. They may use and combine this knowledge with the people who were not affected by Garcinia Cambogia. 21 Kawaguchi T, Harada M, Arimatsu H, Nagata S, Koga Y, Kuwahara R, et al. Severe hepatotoxicity associated with a N-nitrosfenfluramine-containing weight-loss supplement: report of



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

three cases. *J Gastroenterol Hepatol* 2004; 19(3): 349-350 They may also use the information given in the following publication: Arinc, E.: The role of polymorphic cytochrome P450 enzymes in drug design, development and drug interactions with special emphasis on phenotyping. *Journal of Molecular Catalysis B: Enzymatic*, 64 (3-4), 120-122, 2010.