



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 26567

Title: Effectiveness of Exercise in Hepatic Fat Mobilization in Non-Alcoholic Fatty Liver Disease

Reviewer's code: 03023823

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-04-18 16:57

Date reviewed: 2016-04-18 20:16

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The review is interesting, for the topic and for the adopted style of presentation. Please, address some limitation of this overview: Yes, "Exercise is different from activity. Activity refers to any movement requiring energy, that is, not resting. Exercise refers to planned and/or structured movement of a specific intensity, frequency and duration": but it is likely that exercise prescription contribute to modify current, previous physical activity. Moreover, if exercise is a drug, at least for fatty liver, also physical activity conceivably is medicine. Probably some comment should be methodologically appropriate. RE or AE is quite a general itemization: exercise performed open air or not should be defined and this may be a very critical discrimination. Seemingly, not all the reported studies describe overall effect on BMI. The number of dropouts is quite great, and also information on adherence are quite vague, apart the lack of nutritional information at baseline and with some interventional change. Looking at most of the original articles the profiles (physical activity, diet) of these subjects - pre-intervention - seems quite incomplete for allowing any straightforward conclusion. Was physical exercise prescription done with any criterion and preliminary assessment?



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

The point is of interest for MDs, also considering the conclusion: “An exercise intervention of moderate intensity is effective for the mobilization of IHTG. The findings support the view that exercise is effective in reducing IHTG in patients with NAFLD independent of weight loss or dietary manipulation”. Low cardiorespiratory fitness is a prominent behavioral risk factor for cardiovascular disease (CVD) morbidity and mortality, so that a preliminary assessment and a well targeted monitoring is needed when prescribing physical exercise. Check, please, the spelling of few words in Fig. 1



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 26567

Title: Effectiveness of Exercise in Hepatic Fat Mobilization in Non-Alcoholic Fatty Liver Disease

Reviewer's code: 01136482

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-04-18 16:57

Date reviewed: 2016-04-19 18:49

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

- Introduction section: diet, in association with exercise is the cornerstone in the treatment of NAFLD. recently, many data have been reported in this way the efficacy of Mediterranean diet (i.e. Abenavoli et al. World J Gastroenterol 2014). please improve this point. I suggest also, to briefly include data on NAFLD worldwide prevalence (i.e. Msarone et al. Rev Recent Clin Trials 2014) - Discussion section: exercise effectively reduce liver fat. The choice of training should be tailored based on patients preferences to be maintained in the long-term. This point is essential, and was now highlight in the recent EASL guidelines (Hepatology 2016 in press). Please include it and this reference in order to improve your work.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 26567

Title: Effectiveness of Exercise in Hepatic Fat Mobilization in Non-Alcoholic Fatty Liver Disease

Reviewer's code: 02939712

Reviewer's country: Portugal

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-04-18 16:57

Date reviewed: 2016-05-14 12:14

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Golabi et al. presented a review paper entitled "Effectiveness of Exercise in Hepatic Fat Mobilization in Non-Alcoholic Fatty Liver Disease". The aim of the review paper was to investigate the efficacy of exercise interventions on hepatic fat mobilization in NAFLD patients using a systematic review approach. The authors reported that exercise is effective in reducing IHTG in patients with NAFLD independent of weight loss or dietary manipulation and that combining exercise with dietary interventions augments the reduction in IHTG. I enjoyed serving as a reviewer of this manuscript and think it is a very interesting topic. The authors pose a research question that is not really new, yet they use strict selection criteria regarding the assessment of intrahepatic triglycerides (IHTG), together with the description of the interventions. This may add useful information regarding the choice for a specific intervention and may aim to contribute to more healthy, physiological, financial and time efficient clinical practice/intervention in the specific sub-population possibly enhancing the patients' outcome. Nevertheless, after reading the paper, I found several overlooked aspects that need to be addressed. I think this paper needs a throughout revision. Please find detailed comments



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

on the attached file.