



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 2899

Title: Bone metastasis from early gastric cancer following non-curative endoscopic submucosal dissection

Reviewer code: 00029045

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-03-24 09:15

Date reviewed: 2013-03-24 17:23

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This paper is interesting. In my opinion this report could be best referred for WJGE.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 2899

Title: Bone metastasis from early gastric cancer following non-curative endoscopic submucosal dissection

Reviewer code: 00008874

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-03-24 09:15

Date reviewed: 2013-03-27 16:54

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

COMMENTS Authors described a case with early gastric cancer metastasized to bone following non-curative endoscopic submucosal dissection. The ESD was regarded as a non-curative resection in point of histological type, tumor size and existence of an ulcer finding according to the Japanese gastric cancer treatment guidelines 2010. Authors strongly recommended subsequent gastrectomy, but the patient refused surgery. This was the first case of bone metastasis from EGC following a non-curative ESD after an eight-year disease-free interval. This case was educational for readers and had worth to report.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 2899

Title: Bone metastasis from early gastric cancer following non-curative endoscopic submucosal dissection

Reviewer code: 00504213

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-03-24 09:15

Date reviewed: 2013-03-29 08:58

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

GENERAL COMMENTS: Generally, this is an interesting and well-written report describing about a case of bone metastasis from early gastric cancer following non-curative ESD. Bone metastasis from early gastric cancer is very rare. The authors reported the first case of bone metastasis from early gastric cancer following a non-curative ESD after an eight-year disease-free interval. Recently, the indications of ESD have been expanded, and the number of patients, who undergo ESD instead of surgery, has been increasing. This report has suggested two important things concerning to the ESD; the one is applying the indication properly, the next is requiring more than five years period to follow ESD patients involving expanded indications. As bone metastasis is a hematogenous metastasis, so it may not have been avoided in their case even if the patient had undergone a gastrectomy with lympho-node dissection. The early detection test for circulating tumor cells (CTC) may become one of the useful tools for following the cases of non-curative ESD. No ethic problems are there in this manuscript. Overall impression of this manuscript is pretty good and this manuscript would fulfill the criteria of acceptance. **SPECIFIC COMMENTS:** All sections and figures are fine.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 2899

Title: Bone metastasis from early gastric cancer following non-curative endoscopic submucosal dissection

Reviewer code: 00504445

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-03-24 09:15

Date reviewed: 2013-04-01 09:03

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the present paper of Kawabata et al., the authors presented the bone metastasis from early gastric cancer following non-curative endoscopic submucosal dissection. The paper was well written and was interesting. I think this paper has a few problems to be published.

1. Please mention the rate of lymphnode metastasis in intramucosal cancer with ulceration. In addition, authors should explain the rate of poorly differentiated adenocarcinoma in early gastric cancer.
- 2: For readers' understanding, Please mention the rate of metastasis in each organ in EGC.
3. At the last sentence in Page 9, lymph-node dissection should be changed to lymph-node resection.
4. In Figure 3a, lower view in which vertical margin can be confirmed should be described.