



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

ESPS manuscript NO: 14725

Title: Depressive symptoms in neurodegenerative diseases

Reviewer's code: 00646621

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Xiu-Xia Song

Date sent for review: 2014-10-22 14:44

Date reviewed: 2014-11-13 14:59

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this review article, the author(s) consider the role of depression in various clinical psychiatric illnesses including Alzheimer's Disease, Frontotemporal Dementia, Parkinsons, and other dementias and neurodegenerative scenarios. Across the board, it is clear the depression plays an exacerbating role both in terms of its underlying neurological effects as well as its secondary effect through its manifestations in patient behavior and impact on surrounding caregiver interactions. The author(s) highlight that in most studies, depression is usually a basis for exclusion and or a covariate of non-interest. As such, the author(s) suggest that little is therefore known about the role or impact of depression, and a review of the comorbidity of depression with the above illnesses ensues with some potential treatment suggestions. This is indeed an interesting and important topic that deserves more scientific attention. However, the approach and premises of this review article, as well as several problems with writing make it difficult to recommend publication of this manuscript. My main concern is the notion that little is known about how depression interacts with the above psychiatric illnesses. In fact, it is because it is well known that depression modulates psychiatric conditions apart from the base neurological/psychological cause of the conditions, that depression is



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgooffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

kept as an exclusionary criteria in research studies. And studies have been done that examine directly the role of dementia on clinical conditions. Thus, actually, much is known about depression and its comorbidities. Especially with respect to serotonergic activity. Thus, this fundamental approach in this manuscript seems lacking in novel and compelling argument. A possible improvement is perhaps for the author(s) to consider a more specific, focused, detailed and mechanistic review of exactly how depression interacts with a specific disease, down to the neuromolecular levels. And from there, perhaps we can obtain new insight about whether there are novel research directions to pursue. Presently, this manuscript reads like a list of previous finding, with minimal theoretical framework. So the above suggestion is critical. The overall language is also problematic. There are several errors of expression, grammatical errors, and unclear writing that make it difficult to understand what the author(s) mean specifically. Critically, this also impedes the readability of this article. Thus, to summarize, I have two main suggestions: (1) The author(s) should consider having a rigorous scientific theoretical framework about how depression specifically affects clinical cognitive illnesses and (2), they should also improve on the writing style.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

ESPS manuscript NO: 14725

Title: Depressive symptoms in neurodegenerative diseases

Reviewer's code: 02945522

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Xiu-Xia Song

Date sent for review: 2014-10-22 14:44

Date reviewed: 2014-11-13 00:16

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a very interesting and informative review article on the assessment of depressive symptoms in dementia. It highlights the importance and encourages awareness of early identification of these symptoms in dementia, as well as effective treatment. Minor comments/questions: 1- The paper needs editing, which will improve clarity. The following are excerpts from the paper with my comments: "The recognition of depression in Alzheimer's patients may be a challenge for different reasons: first of all, the absence of a validated questionnaire to detect and quantify the disorder. Second, dementia symptoms itself can be associated to typical features of depression such as apathy, loss of interest in daily activities and anhedonia (this sounds repetitive. Isn't anhedonia loss of interest?), masking the depressive disorder. Finally, the cognitive impairment of these patients difficult the expression of sadness, hopelessness and other common feelings related" ("related" to what?. These sentence needs some work). "However, neither corticobasal syndrome patients have always corticobasal degeneration neuropathology when their brain is studied, nor corticobasal histopathology itself produces always corticobasal syndrome." This last sentence could use some editing to make it flow better. "1.INTRODUCTION" I THINK THAT THIS CAN BE LABELED



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

“Abstract.” “DEPRESSION, DEPRESSIVE SYMPTOMS AND COGNITION” If the “1.Introduction” becomes the “abstract” then this subtitle can be labeled the Introduction. 2- Do studies report on the validity of the scales/questionnaires in Tables 2 and 3 when used with Hispanics and African Americans? 3- The Hamilton Depression Rating Scale and the Geriatric Depression Scale, among others, are used to assess depression in dementia. Do the authors have any comments on their validity to assess depression in dementia?



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

ESPS manuscript NO: 14725

Title: Depressive symptoms in neurodegenerative diseases

Reviewer's code: 02445374

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Xiu-Xia Song

Date sent for review: 2014-10-22 14:44

Date reviewed: 2014-11-24 22:52

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Excellent review. No major concerns. Would change DSM V in text to DSM 5.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

ESPS manuscript NO: 14725

Title: Depressive symptoms in neurodegenerative diseases

Reviewer's code: 00646254

Reviewer's country: South Korea

Science editor: Xiu-Xia Song

Date sent for review: 2014-10-22 14:44

Date reviewed: 2014-11-06 16:26

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this study, the authors have reviewed about the depressive symptoms in neurodegenerative disease including Alzheimer's disease. However, there are several errors in this paper: 1. Page 3, neurodegeneratives diseases ?--> neurodegenerative diseases 2. Page 3, Frecuently --> Frequently 3. Page 4, hopeleness --> hopelessness 4. Page 6, Characteristicly --> Characteristically 5. Page 6, of Frontotemporal dementia --> of frontotemporal dementia 6. Page 7, Alzheimer's Disease --> Alzheimer's disease 7. Page 10, atherosclerotic dementia dementia -->? atherosclerotic dementia