



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 23184

Title: Impact of non-oncological factors on tumor recurrence after liver transplantation in hepatocellular carcinoma patients

Reviewer's code: 00182548

Reviewer's country: Romania

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2015-10-28 17:56

Date reviewed: 2015-11-11 03:28

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review is very useful for clinicians. The content of the article is interesting, but it should be systematized. It's good to also be included a table with referenced studies. I recommend to authors to also add other causes of post-transplant HCC recurrence (eg postoperative complications occurrence - Zhou YM, Zhang XF, Li B, Sui CJ, Yang JM. Postoperative complications affect early recurrence of hepatocellular carcinoma after curative resection. BMC Cancer. 2015 Oct 14;15:689). Writing bibliography should follow the directions of this magazine. After completing and systematization, the article can be published.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 23184

Title: Impact of non-oncological factors on tumor recurrence after liver transplantation in hepatocellular carcinoma patients

Reviewer's code: 00503516

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2015-10-28 17:56

Date reviewed: 2015-11-07 05:18

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Xiang-Qian Gu et al Therefore, discuss the role of non-oncological factors on tumor recurrence after liver transplantation; the individuation of such factors can contribute to reduce recurrence and improve survival. The work is well written and understandable; the different sections are properly organized and presented. I suggest including a table/section briefly explaining the different techniques usable to perform liver transplantation. Finally, I have not seen any reference of the figure in the text, I suggest including it.



ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 23184

Title: Impact of non-oncological factors on tumor recurrence after liver transplantation in hepatocellular carcinoma patients

Reviewer’s code: 00680628

Reviewer’s country: Taiwan

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2015-10-28 17:56

Date reviewed: 2015-11-10 01:08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

MAJOR COMMENTS: The authors aimed to summarize the “Impact of non-oncological factors on tumor recurrence after liver transplantation (LT) in patients with hepatocellular carcinoma (HCC). However, the length of the manuscript is too long. As the structure is too loose, half of the length could be decreased. To make the manuscript more concise, major revision was suggested.

MINOR COMMENTS: 1. For easy understanding, please use Table(s) to categorize factors and show the real recurrent rates between subjects with/without different factors, related references (authors, year published) could also be shown. 2. The non-oncological factor should be categorized by the donor side and recipient side (patients with HCC), then describing different effects about tumor recurrent rates. 3. This manuscript described the different effects of living and deceased donor liver on tumor recurrence of post-LT HCC. Do other factors affect tumor recurrence? Such as donor liver (partial or whole liver), sex, age, BMI, hepatitis virus infections (with or without antiviral treatment), any liver disease (steato-hepatitis), life habits (habitual smoking or alcohol drinking), diabetes mellitus, HIV, etc. 4. There are many errors in “references” section, please revised them. 5. The mechanisms of



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

HBV/HCV-related carcinogenesis may be omitted or described briefly.