



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5495

Title: The Role of HER2 in Gastric Cancer - Biological and Pharmacological Aspects

Reviewer code: 00505438

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-09-13 11:27

Date reviewed: 2013-09-22 18:58

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting paper reviewing the role of HER 2 in gastric cancer. However this paper spends a large amount of time summarising previous publications, without really giving new information or performing any true analysis of data. Similar systematic review was performed and published by Chua and Merrett Clinicopathologic factors associated with HER2-positive gastric cancer and its impact on survival outcomes--a systematic review. *Int J Cancer*. 2012 Jun 15;130(12):2845-56 is not referenced, although The data and analysis of the TOGA is worthy but is based on a study which is well described, accepted and published in 2010. There is really nothing new on this analysis. The association between HER 2 overexpression and prognosis in intestinal type gastric cancers is only mentioned obliquely and should be emphasised. The details on different drugs are perhaps too detailed for this journal



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5495

Title: The Role of HER2 in Gastric Cancer - Biological and Pharmacological Aspects

Reviewer code: 00208526

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-09-13 11:27

Date reviewed: 2013-10-26 01:16

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The Role of HER2 in Gastric Cancer- Biological and Pharmacological Aspects This review focuses on the status of HER2 in gastric and gastroesophageal junction (GEJ) cancer. The authors do a really good job of relaying important information about HER2 in these types of cancers. In particular, the authors focus on the following topics: 1) HER2 screening 2) Variability of HER2 overexpression 3) HER2 and Lauren histological classification 4) The ToGA trial 5) HER2 and prognosis 6) Potential HER2 targeted drugs that can be used clinically Strengths: The article represents viewpoints fairly and lacks biased opinions. The authors also summarize a broad range of studies that have been conducted to examine HER2 and its implication in gastric and GEJ cancers. Overall, the review stays focused on important research without going into unnecessary detail. Weaknesses/ minor concerns: 1. Weak abstract: the abstract fails to tell the reader about the main focus of the article, which is to discuss the current status of HER2 in gastric and GEJ cancer and future directions. 2. Review contains an excessive amount of information about the ToGA trial 3. Some of the figures are somewhat vague a. Figure 3 has a typo (FISH -; not FISH ÷) b. Table 2 needs footnote for N; it is also presented twice (once on page 28 and again on page 29). 4. Poor sentence structure and several grammatical errors/typos within the review. Some Examples: a. "Examples of a positive HER2 status in gastric cancer by IHC and FISH are shown Figure 1." b. "In table 1 is shown the interpretation..." c. A large interstudy variation of the prevalence of HER2 overexpression in gastric cancer is seen." d. "This survey also looked at HER2 amplification, however, here the number of patients were somewhat lower. The prevalence estimate was here based on 1,597 patients..." e. "A number of studies has shown..." f. "...was found to be statistical significantly higher..." g. "The ToGA trial must be regarded as a landmark in the treatment of gastric cancer, not only did the study



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

show that trastuzumab is effective in treating HER2 overexpressing gastric cancer but it also gave us important information on the pathophysiological characteristics of the disease.”



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5495

Title: The Role of HER2 in Gastric Cancer - Biological and Pharmacological Aspects

Reviewer code: 00057485

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-09-13 11:27

Date reviewed: 2013-10-30 20:30

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Jorgensen provides a review of HER2 directed treatments undergoing active study in the setting of gastric cancer. The review is detailed, well rounded and clear. The author has strong mastery of describing the scientific methods, clinical trials and future drugs in development. I would suggest (for the redy not familiar with HER2) some basic diagrams cell mambrane drug interaction.