



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

Manuscript NO: 44929

Title: Surgical complications after different therapeutic approaches for locally advanced rectal cancer

Reviewer’s code: 00722213

Reviewer’s country: Romania

Science editor: Ruo-Yu Ma

Date sent for review: 2018-12-27

Date reviewed: 2018-12-27

Review time: 7 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer’s expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> General
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this paper the authors evaluated the rate and severity of post-radiotherapy complications in patients with rectal adenocarcinoma. The paper is valuable but evaluation of leakage and wounds is not enough. At the moment, the scientific level of



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

paper is not high. However, there are some aspects that can be added, to increase the scientific value. It would be usefull to compare the rate and severity of complications with tyhe histological regression score and presence or absence of the controversial acellular mucin pools, that are positive or negative for CEA (no data are published yet in literature presenting these corrlations). For references, regarding the evaluation of mucin pools, see papers such J Surg Oncol. 2018;118(7):1129-1134. doi: 10.1002/jso.25247 and Cancer Biother Radiopharm. 2014;29(7):295-7. doi: 10.1089/cbr.2014.1640

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

Manuscript NO: 44929

Title: Surgical complications after different therapeutic approaches for locally advanced rectal cancer

Reviewer's code: 03390217

Reviewer's country: Spain

Science editor: Ruo-Yu Ma

Date sent for review: 2018-12-27

Date reviewed: 2019-01-04

Review time: 8 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

"Surgical complications after different therapeutic approaches for locally advanced rectal cancer" is an interesting and well written paper about surgical complications related to preoperative-or not- RT schemes. I think the paper- although it is yet enough good for



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

publication, it would increase its interest and quality including two points (or adding another paper): Since the sample is from 2008-2010 and it includes more than 1000 p., it would be interesting some data about the outcome of the different groups, at least the local control (3-5y),. Another point of interest would be the study of some incontinence test like Wexner... and also the quality of life in pts with non-APR patients. It would be interesting to complete this article with others in the next future.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No