



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5351

Title: Study on anxiety and depression propensities in patients with the toxic liver injury in Korea: A multi-center, nation-wide, prospective study

Reviewer code: 00058104

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-09-02 17:21

Date reviewed: 2013-09-08 09:48

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

General Comments: The authors present a very interesting study that investigates the tendency for psychiatric disorders among patients with toxic acute liver injury. The authors conclude that there is need for multidisciplinary approach with psychiatric consultation for patients with acute liver injury due to herb and folk remedies. This is an innovative consideration in terms of public health and prevention policies, however, study design and results do not highly support the conclusions made.

Specific Comments Material and methods Authors should provide more information regarding the inclusion / exclusion criteria for the study population, since the study design described raises the following questions: - How was defined the acute nature of the liver injury? - What was the AST/ALT cutoff value in order to exclude patients that answered the questionnaires? - Why patients with drug-induced acute liver injury were excluded? Could not these patients qualify as control group (2nd group)? - Why patients with already known psychiatric pathology were excluded? Should this contribute to selection bias? - In the 2nd group were included patients with alcoholic hepatitis; how was defined the acute onset of liver injury? Also, are these patients considered free of anxiety and / or depression given their underline disease? - 34 of 124 patients in the 2nd group have acute liver injury of unknown etiology; do they qualify as control? It would be a great advantage of the manuscript if the authors could address these points in the material and methods section or comment on these points in the discussion section.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5351

Title: Study on anxiety and depression propensities in patients with the toxic liver injury in Korea: A multi-center, nation-wide, prospective study

Reviewer code: 00053786

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-09-02 17:21

Date reviewed: 2013-09-10 07:55

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Jeong Il Suh et al presents an interesting study that investigated anxiety and depression propensities in 375 patients with toxic liver injury in different hospital centers in Korea. The authors' work contributes to the field of knowledge for the clinical management of patients with toxic liver injury by making awareness of underlining psychological conditions that may promote the consumption of herbal medications and folk remedies to alleviate malaise. This paper is well written, minor comments should be addressed.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5351

Title: Study on anxiety and depression propensities in patients with the toxic liver injury in Korea: A multi-center, nation-wide, prospective study

Reviewer code: 00053724

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-09-02 17:21

Date reviewed: 2013-09-10 22:48

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

see attached file



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5351

Title: Study on anxiety and depression propensities in patients with the toxic liver injury in Korea: A multi-center, nation-wide, prospective study

Reviewer code: 00061678

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-09-02 17:21

Date reviewed: 2013-09-14 04:28

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear Editors, Authors Thank you for sending the manuscript "Study on anxiety and depression propensities in patients with the toxic liver injury in Korea: A multi-center, nation-wide, prospective study" for revision. Please accept the following comments: - It is a good search idea inspite of being studied in other different diseases. - Authors did not mentioned what are the parameters of diagnosis of toxic or non toxic (clinical and laboratory) - What are the degree of liver affection and is it related to search result or not?? - What are exactly types and doses of remedies used because special types might lead to these psychological effects others not . - There is lack of inclusion and exclusion criteria for patients, eg what are psychological history or background for such patients. - I think methodology as regard to previous points should be thoroughly revised before acceptance . Thanks,



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5351

Title: Study on anxiety and depression propensities in patients with the toxic liver injury in Korea: A multi-center, nation-wide, prospective study

Reviewer code: 00057978

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-09-02 17:21

Date reviewed: 2013-09-16 03:11

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

GENERAL COMMENTS MAY CONSIST OF FOUR MAJOR POINTS This is an interesting study on anxiety and depression propensities in patients with the toxic liver injury in Korea. In this multi-center and prospective research, the authors investigated anxiety and depression propensities in patients with the toxic acute liver injury and compared with the results in patients in a control group and non-toxic acute liver injury. There are not a lot of studies regarding this problem. Presentation and readability of the manuscript is good. Ethics of the research is appropriate. SPECIFIC COMMENTS MAY CONSIST OF THE FOLLOWING POINTS Title: it partly reflects the major topic and contents of the study. The authors investigated only patients with the toxic acute liver injuries. Therefore the title "Study on anxiety and depression propensities in patients with the toxic liver injury in Korea: A multi-center, nation-wide, prospective study" is incomplete. The title "Study on anxiety and depression propensities in patients with the acute toxic liver injury in Korea: A multi-center, nation-wide, prospective study" would be more precise for this article. Abstract: It gives a clear delineation of the research background, objectives, materials and methods, results (including important data) and conclusions. Materials and methods: Materials include a large sanumber of patients from ten university hospitals in Korea. The subjects were divided into three groups: a control group (n=125), a non-toxic acute liver injury group (n=124), and a toxic acute liver injury group involving toxic hepatitis (n=125). These three groups were compared and appreciated through the questionnaire using the scales of anxiety and depression. Obtained data were analyzed. The proper statistical methods were used in this study. The precise inclusion and exclusion criteria should be presented in this study. According to the authors; "the toxic liver injury was defined as the



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

acute liver injury, which was caused by medicinal herbs, plant preparations, health foods and folk remedies except commercial drugs, having the score of 4 or higher on the RUCAM scale". Why was the toxic liver injury caused by drugs excluded from this study? The toxic liver injury includes injuries due to all mentioned above factors. It is not clear for a reader. Also, sources for criteria for diagnosis of " the acute liver injury" as follows: "The acute liver injury was defined as the case that ALT or the conjugated bilirubin value was increased two times or more than the normal upper limit thereof, or that ALT, alkaline phosphatase and total bilirubin were increased together and at least one of them was two times or more as much as the normal upper limit thereof" should be presented, and adequate references should be cited. Results: The results provide sufficient experimental evidence or data to draw firm scientific conclusions. The sample size and the statistical data, including graphic data that reflect the results, are adequate for a clinical study. Discussion: It is well organized, and systematic theoretical analyses and valuable conclusions are provided. References: The references are appropriate, relevant, and updated. Tables and figures: Tables reflect the major findings of the study, and they are appropriately presented.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5351

Title: Study on anxiety and depression propensities in patients with the toxic liver injury in Korea: A multi-center, nation-wide, prospective study

Reviewer code: 00043561

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-09-02 17:21

Date reviewed: 2013-09-16 21:06

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I carefully evaluated the manuscript titled "Study on anxiety and depression propensities in patients with the toxic liver injury in Korea: A multi-center, nation-wide, prospective study" BY Suh et al. In this prospective controlled clinical study, the authors aimed to investigate whether the frequency of anxiety and/or depression is increased in subjects with toxic liver injury. Although many of us expect to find anxiety, it is important that the authors observed depression more frequently than anxiety. This may be interesting for our readers. Inclusion of people without liver disease and people with increased liver transaminases due to other causes of liver injury are appreciated in the design of the study. However, the positive control group with non-toxic liver injury is quite heterogeneous. In such a case, I would recommend inclusion patients with the same or similar duration of illness. While HAV infection and liver injury occurs suddenly, HBV infection causes slower progression. Abstract: OK Introduction: This section is too long. The readers can read general information regarding toxic liver injury in specific papers that can be found in the past issues of this journal. Methods: I could not understand why the authors excluded those subjects with previously diagnosed mood disorders from the study. This causes reduction in the number of the disease cases in the real life. Nevertheless, this issue is a matter of choice but, in such case, the title and the content of the paper should be modified into something like "Frequency of undetected mood disorders in ...". The timing of neuropsychological testing is not clear in the text and this is a major issue. Discussion: A brief summary of the result could be suitable at the beginning of this section. The frequency of anxiety and depression all increases in hospitalized subjects. The frequency of mood disorders in these individuals increases with the number of comorbidities and polypharmacy. The major limitation of