



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13646

Title: Emerging concepts in liver graft preservation

Reviewer code: 02943658

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-08-31 10:41

Date reviewed: 2014-09-05 01:23

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors reviewed technics and innovations in liver graft preservation. They have made an extensive medical review adding proper inferences and conclusions. The manuscript should be accepted for publication after native English speaker review.



ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13646

Title: Emerging concepts in liver graft preservation

Reviewer code: 02943640

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-08-31 10:41

Date reviewed: 2014-09-14 23:43

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the present paper, Bejaoui and coworkers propose a review of the different methods of liver graft preservation, focusing on the last advances in both static cold storage and machine perfusion. With the increasing utilization of suboptimal grafts in daily practice, an up-to-date overview is clearly of interest and deserves publication. However, I have some minor remarks: - The structure of the review is partially weak and it is difficult to understand what the Authors want to highlight. For example, in the section 'Modification of static preservation solutions' (in which different compounds are listed and shortly introduced and described), it is difficult for the reader to understand which of these new alternatives are promising and deserve further studies or have been already implemented in human liver transplantation. In addition, Authors cite the recent work of Berendsen et al, giving a short summary of their findings: it is difficult to understand what 'supercooling' actually means and how it can be achieved; given the promising results reported and the new and different approach used to achieve graft preservation, more details about this technique should be given. - The paper should mention also other commercially available low-viscosity preservation solutions for static cold storage, such as HTK? and Celsior?. In particular, the latter solution is widely employed in many European countries. - Please, replace the word 'marginal' graft with 'suboptimal' throughout the paper. In fact, as per dictionary, the word 'marginal' has a distinct negative meaning, which poses at legal risk the physicians who decide to use such grafts for a transplant. - Regarding Normothermic Machine Perfusion, the latest ILTS London Congress (June 2014) presentation of the 20 human cases



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

performed using Metra? should be cited and summarized (Ravikumar R first Author from the Oxford research group of Mr Peter Friend: Human Liver Transplantation using Normothermic Machine Perfision, Liver Transplantation, 2014; 20: S103). - There are several minor English language errors that should be amended; also the English style could be improved.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13646

Title: Emerging concepts in liver graft preservation

Reviewer code: 02566971

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-08-31 10:41

Date reviewed: 2014-09-01 17:06

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a well constructed review article which comprehensively summarizes the current pros and cons of hepatic graft preservation, as well as the emerging perspectives and technologies in this area. I have the following comments: 1) It would be ideal to go a bit further on the bioengineering of liver grafts. 2) This article needs some language polishing.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13646

Title: Emerging concepts in liver graft preservation

Reviewer code: 00743117

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-08-31 10:41

Date reviewed: 2014-09-02 13:38

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript entitled, "Emerging concepts in liver graft preservation" by Bejaoui M et al., performed the literature review of the current topics of the organ preservation solutions and the machine perfusion techniques in liver transplantation. This study, coming from experts of organ preservation and bioengineering, is well-organized review. I have some comments. Comments 1. Authors should refer briefly to other commercial organ preservation solutions, such as Euro-Collins, Custodiol, and Celsior. 2. Please make a concise table regarding modification agents for commercial preservation solutions for the manifestness. 3. There are several typos and grammatical errors in the text. Please correct these errors.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13646

Title: Emerging concepts in liver graft preservation

Reviewer code: 00053868

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-08-31 10:41

Date reviewed: 2014-09-04 06:06

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors have made an interesting review on an interesting topic (preservation of graft livers for transplantation). I have only one comment: the temperatures of definition of hypothermic/normothermic/subnormothermic should be included.