Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases
Manuscript NO: 85049
Title: Jackstone in the renal calyx: A rare case report

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed
Peer-review model: Single blind
Reviewer’s code: 03604107
Position: Editorial Board
Academic degree: MD, PhD
Professional title: Professor
Reviewer’s Country/Territory: Albania
Author’s Country/Territory: China
Manuscript submission date: 2023-04-10
Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique
Reviewer accepted review: 2023-04-10 05:35
Reviewer performed review: 2023-04-14 15:46
Review time: 4 Days and 10 Hours

Scientific quality
[ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Very good [ ] Grade C: Good
[ ] Grade D: Fair [ ] Grade E: Do not publish

Novelty of this manuscript
[ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Good [ ] Grade C: Fair
[ ] Grade D: No novelty

Creativity or innovation of this manuscript
[ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Good [ ] Grade C: Fair
[ ] Grade D: No creativity or innovation
SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS
This is a really good case and a well-written paper. A few suggestions: Case summary, line 35: renal calyx. Numbers 3185 makes no sense, please delete. Lines 124 and following: Intermittent gross hematuria, obstructive lower urinary tract symptoms (LUTS), and abdominal or flank pain are often found in jackstone patients. While agreeing with the authors, I think all nephrolithiasis has the same clinical picture. If there is any particularity in the clinical picture of jackstone patients (which I doubt) please report it accordingly. Otherwise, make a differential diagnosis with other disorders causing a renal colica.
Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases
Manuscript NO: 85049
Title: Jackstone in the renal calyx: A rare case report
Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed
Peer-review model: Single blind
Reviewer’s code: 03761355
Position: Editorial Board
Academic degree: FASN, FRCP, MD
Professional title: Professor
Reviewer’s Country/Territory: United States
Author’s Country/Territory: China
Manuscript submission date: 2023-04-10
Reviewer chosen by: Geng-Long Liu
Reviewer accepted review: 2023-05-20 13:38
Reviewer performed review: 2023-06-02 13:06
Review time: 12 Days and 23 Hours

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scientific quality</th>
<th>Grade A: Excellent</th>
<th>Grade B: Very good</th>
<th>Grade C: Good</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Novelty of this manuscript</th>
<th>Grade A: Excellent</th>
<th>Grade B: Good</th>
<th>Grade C: Fair</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Creativity or innovation of this manuscript</th>
<th>Grade A: Excellent</th>
<th>Grade B: Good</th>
<th>Grade C: Fair</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>[ ]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear editor, Thank you for asking me to review the manuscript. Jackstone is a well described entity in the literature. I feel the authors can present the report focussing on the images with a brief description. Sincerely KK Sureshkumar MD. The authors present a case of Jackstone in renal calyx with hydronephrosis. Jackstone is a well described entity and there are multiple reports of it in the literature. So the case is not novel. I feel it is more appropriate to present the case as an image in clinical medicine: Showing the CT findings and the photo of the stone with a brief description that will capture more attention from readers.