



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 37044

Title: Vitamin D levels do not predict hepatic fibrosis in NAFLD. A systematic review and meta-analysis.

Reviewer’s code: 03478404

Reviewer’s country: Romania

Science editor: Jin-Xin Kong

Date sent for review: 2017-11-08

Date reviewed: 2017-11-13

Review time: 5 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors investigated the relationship between 25-hydroxyvitamin (OH)D levels and fibrosis stage in patients with non-alcoholic fatty liver disease (NAFLD). The manuscript is very well written, easily to be followed, the literature search is comprehensive, inclusion and exclusion criteria - well defined. Statistical analysis of the included studies is very well performed. Results are clearly presented, with attention to details. Figures and Tables are illustrative and show the most important data. The “Discussion” paragraph is beautifully written, including studies where vitamin D was given as a supplement. Limitations of this meta-analysis are also mentioned by the authors. References are up to date and relevant studies have been included and discussed. I have one major comment: There are 2 (two titles) mentioned in the manuscript and they are controversial - one says “NO”, the other says “YES”: 1. “Vitamin D levels do not



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

predict hepatic fibrosis in NAFLD. A systematic review and meta-analysis." 2. "Vitamin D Levels in Patients with Non-Alcoholic Fatty Liver Disease Predicts the Stage of Hepatic Fibrosis: A PRISMA Compliant Systematic Review and Meta-analysis of Pooled Data" (should be "predict", but this is not the issue) Also, 1. In the core tip is written "Our systematic review of the literature and meta-regression confirms that the serum 25-hydroxyvitamin D levels in patients with NAFLD are associated with the severity of hepatic fibrosis" 2. However, the conclusion of the abstract and of the study supports the idea that "Low vitamin D status is not associated with higher stages of liver fibrosis in patients with NAFLD" meaning that "progression of fibrosis in subjects with NALFD is not linked to low vitamin D status". This major controversy should be corrected.



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 37044

Title: Vitamin D levels do not predict hepatic fibrosis in NAFLD. A systematic review and meta-analysis.

Reviewer's code: 00073425

Reviewer's country: Poland

Science editor: Jin-Xin Kong

Date sent for review: 2017-11-08

Date reviewed: 2017-11-14

Review time: 6 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper, meta-analysis study, presents the relationship between 25(OH)D levels and fibrosis stage in NAFLD. In the Introduction section the Authors present the epidemiology of NAFLD and the role and metabolism of 25(OH)D in human body and potential links of vitamin D serum level and fibrosis of NAFLD. This part is well prepared and contains the most important information. Further, the results of selected studies are analyzed. They are controversial. However, on their base the Authors tried to conclude that the relationship between 25(OH)D serum level and fibrosis in the course of NAFLD is not found. This paper considers the essential issue of vitamin D deficiency in patient with liver diseases not only with NAFLD. This association is ambiguous and difficult to clarify. Nevertheless, the paper is the successful attempt to answer the question about the role of vitamin D in pathogenesis of liver fibrosis in NAFLD.



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 37044

Title: Vitamin D levels do not predict hepatic fibrosis in NAFLD. A systematic review and meta-analysis.

Reviewer's code: 00049727

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Jin-Xin Kong

Date sent for review: 2017-11-08

Date reviewed: 2017-11-16

Review time: 7 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Saberi et al. performed meta-analysis to show no relationship between serum 25-hydroxyvitamin D concentrations and NAFLD fibrosis. There are several points to be solved. 1. Abstract: The statement regarding methodology is involved in Results section. 2. Core tip is different from your conclusion in Abstracts and text. 3. The authors should state the validity of 25-hydroxyvitamin D measurement for assessment of vitamin D insufficiency. Is this type of vitamin D the most suitable indicator for vitamin D metabolism? 4. The authors should discuss the influence of diet, circadian rhythm, and season for serum 25-hydroxyvitamin D concentrations. Based on these shortcomings, it is difficult to evaluate the association between serum vitamin D and NAFLD.



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 37044

Title: Vitamin D levels do not predict hepatic fibrosis in NAFLD. A systematic review and meta-analysis.

Reviewer’s code: 00053433

Reviewer’s country: Brazil

Science editor: Jin-Xin Kong

Date sent for review: 2017-11-08

Date reviewed: 2017-11-24

Review time: 15 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This was an interesting systematic review with meta-regression aiming at evaluating the relationship between 25-hydroxyvitamin (OH)D levels and fibrosis stage in patients with non-alcoholic fatty liver disease (NAFLD). A fare number of patients have been analyzed (937 subjects from six cross-sectional studies). By using adequate methodology, the authors have concluded that low vitamin D status is not associated with higher stages of liver fibrosis in patients with NAFLD. This is a relevant topic, given the high prevalence of NAFLD worldwide and the long lasting controversy on the association between advanced liver fibrosis and vitamin D in patients with different chronic liver diseases. The manuscript is well written and has scientific value. Authors are kindly asked to correct the text in the “Core Tip” section: “...Our systematic review of the literature and meta-regression confirms that the serum 25-hydroxyvitamin D levels in patients with



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

NAFLD are NOT associated with the severity of hepatic fibrosis.”