



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 2283

Title: A practical atlas allowing pathologists to identify Focal Nodular Hyperplasia (FNH) and subtypes of Hepatocellular Adenomas (HCA) on resected material.

Reviewer code: 01807775

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-02-16 14:21

Date reviewed: 2013-03-07 15:30

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Very good paper summarizing and illustrating state of the art data on benign hepatocellular nodules.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 2283

Title: A practical atlas allowing pathologists to identify Focal Nodular Hyperplasia (FNH) and subtypes of Hepatocellular Adenomas (HCA) on resected material.

Reviewer code: 02441405

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-02-16 14:21

Date reviewed: 2013-03-12 03:46

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript provides a comprehensive review of focal nodular hyperplasia (FNH) and common types of hepatocellular adenoma (HCA) in resection specimens. All pictures are original, and representative. It has a great value for teaching and education purpose. Major concerns: 1. A large body of pictures are organized in an ineffective way and the presentation is hard to follow through, particularly for HCA. Recommend to describe the macroscopy, microscopy, special stain, and immunostain pictures of each individual type or subtype of tumor in continuous order. Differential diagnosis should be the end of each type or subtype description. Maybe a table or diagram can provide better presentation. 2. No references are given for many comments and conclusions. Please provide references for the conclusions not resulting from the manuscript. 3. There are many grammatical errors through manuscript. It needs significant polish, particularly in page 3 (Introduction), Figure legends, and Recommendations. 4. Figure 1C legend: It appears to be a typical FNH macroscopy picture, showing well-demarcation and central scar. An explanation is needed when authors claimed that the findings are not self-evident for FNH. 5. Figure 9 C,D legend: Author should provide references or explain why rosette formation is suggestive of malignant transformation. In our practice, rosette formation in HCA is not an uncommon event; it is just a histological feature of HCA. Minor issues: 1. In Reference: please provide page number for reference 2. 2. Need magnification for each micrograph.