



ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 27007

Title: Lycopene modulates cellular proliferation, glycolysis and hepatic ultra-structure during hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 03538959

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2016-05-05 11:21

Date reviewed: 2016-05-18 21:14

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript entitled "Lycopene modulates cellular proliferation, glycolysis and hepatic ultra-structure during hepatocellular carcinoma" investigated the effect of lycopene on ultra-structure, glycolytic enzymes, cell proliferation markers and hypoxia during N-Nitrosodiethylamine (NDEA) induced hepatocarcinogenesis. There were some questions to be addressed: 1. The cancer type of the animal model should be specified in the Highlights. 2. The author needs to display and detail the HE images of HCC occurrence. 3. How did the author get the conclusion that lycopene modulates cellular proliferation without MTT in vitro? 4. Why the author chose the ELISA method to detect the proteins in liver tissues? 5. The title should be corrected clear and concise.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 27007

Title: Lycopene modulates cellular proliferation, glycolysis and hepatic ultra-structure during hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer’s code: 00504391

Reviewer’s country: Mexico

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2016-05-05 11:21

Date reviewed: 2016-05-19 03:33

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Gupta et al. show interesting data of the protective effects of lycopene on hepatocellular carcinoma development, focusing on ultrastructural changes and the expression of a few genes/proteins. The work is interesting, however, some issues should be solved. Major comments: 1. No major changes in liver ultrastructure are found between the NDEA- and the Lycopene+NDEA treated groups. Please discuss thoroughly. 2. Based on the lycopene amount provided to the animals, how much lycopene should a person take to prevent HCC? Which are the potential side-effects of such concentrations? 3. Definitely, the language should be revised by experts. 4. Figure 4 is confusing. The title indicates that it is the mRNA expression but the Table in the graph indicates “Protein” Please clarify. 5. Did they observe the ultrastructural changes in all the NDEA treated animals? No analysis exists of such observations. The authors should show a quantitative analysis of the SEM and TEM observations. 6. Based on the gene and protein expression changes observed, the authors should add a new Figure showing the potential mechanism of HCC prevention by lycopene. Minor comments 2. In some cases, spaces are missing between values and units. 3. Description of Panel G is missing in Figures 1 and 2,



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

please make it clear. 4. In the Results Section, the authors should specify from the very beginning of the corresponding paragraph if they refer to either mRNA or protein expression. 5. Discussion. The authors mention that "Electron micrographs(SEM and TEM) of liver biopsies from different groups provided a real picture of 3-D in-vivo tissue modulations..." They are not showing real pictures in vivo, they are actually removing the tissues from the animal. Please rephrase.