



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 17789

Title: Genetic and epigenetic aspects of initiation and progression of hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 03015689

Reviewer's country: Spain

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-03-27 08:24

Date reviewed: 2015-04-05 02:44

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This article presents a very comprehensive list of genes involved in the field of HCC in a very clear and methodical way, being the sources used excellent and the information very up to date. In my opinion the article could greatly benefit from the addition of a sum up of the most relevant or useful genes in clinical practice so that the reader can have an immediate idea of which are the most important ones. Regarding readability, it has a very reader friendly approach. I have thoroughly enjoyed reviewing your article and I am looking forward to reading the next one



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 17789

Title: Genetic and epigenetic aspects of initiation and progression of hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 03251929

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-03-27 08:24

Date reviewed: 2015-04-13 15:21

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review article has extensively summarized the findings of the following genes in HCC: IL6, MACC1, SIRT1, TPX2, TREM1, MAGE, ARNT, BTG1, GPX3, FBLN5. The review has also summarized some deregulated epigenetically silenced genes (TIF1a, DPTSL3, DPT, PDSS2) and some microRNAs (miR-128-2, miR-148, miR-331). The manuscript has provided substantial amount of information but the rationales for the gene list remain unclear. I think the authors should strengthen the links between the genes and explain the choice of their genes. Otherwise, authors would feel that the manuscript is lack of focus. My major concern is the context of the manuscript. Other than that, the manuscript is written fluently and clearly.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 17789

Title: Genetic and epigenetic aspects of initiation and progression of hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 02766291

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-03-27 08:24

Date reviewed: 2015-04-13 18:20

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The focus of the review by Kanda M et al. is to provide an overview of some molecular targets that are altered by genetic (point mutations, gene amplification, etc) and epigenetic mutations and cause the initiation or the progression of HCC, in order to develop new diagnostic tools and/or therapeutic targets. In general, the review is well structured, although it lacks figures and/or diagrams for clarification (i.e. a schematic representation of the mechanisms of genetic or epigenetic alteration of the status in HCC). The topic discussed in the review has already been fully covered by others, even recently and also in the WJG (2014 Epigenetics in hepatocellular carcinoma: An update and future perspectives therapy WJG). However, the targets and the miRNA analyzed here are relatively new and there are many recent articles that are cited in this review (2014-2015). It must be said that the paragraphs concerning the individual genes are poorly developed. For example on SIRT1 and HCC there are many recent articles that may help to deepen the topic. (Zhang ZY et al. J Hepatol 2015 62, 121-130; Song S et al. J Coll Physicians Surg Pak 2014 24, 849-854; Bae HJ Oncogene 2014 15 (20), 2557-2567). Furthermore, there are three articles on TPX2 and HCC published in the 2014 that may



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

help to deepen the subject of the review. Also the Authors should clarify what are the criteria by which they choose some genes (very few!) from Table I to be analyzed in detail. Minor points The name of the genes must be written in italics