



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 29234

Title: FECAL MICROBIAL TRANSPLANT FOR THE TREATMENT OF PEDIATRIC INFLAMMATORY BOWEL DISEASE

Reviewer's code: 00503545

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2016-08-05 11:02

Date reviewed: 2016-08-30 15:10

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this review, the authors summarize existing literature on the role of fecal microbial transplant (FMT) in IBD, and discuss current trials, challenges, and opportunities for this treatment in the future. This paper has been well written and the theme of the review is a topic of note in this field. Although the contents of the review are interesting, the authors should address the following points.

1. The authors should number the references according to the citation order in the text.
2. Cited reference number also should be shown in the Tables.
3. Style of the Tables should be revised.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 29234

Title: FECAL MICROBIAL TRANSPLANT FOR THE TREATMENT OF PEDIATRIC INFLAMMATORY BOWEL DISEASE

Reviewer's code: 00158526

Reviewer's country: Slovenia

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2016-08-05 11:02

Date reviewed: 2016-09-05 03:47

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Review for the manuscript No: 29234 Manuscript Title FECAL MICROBIAL TRANSPLANT FOR THE TREATMENT OF PEDIATRIC INFLAMMATORY BOWEL DISEASE General comment: This is a well-done review about the potential role of fecal microbial transplant in IBD treatment in children. Comments: - there is insufficient data about possible theoretical backgrounds for treating patient with stool transplantations. What are the possible mechanisms? - the author should discuss more about possible ways to deliver fecal samples (advantages, disadvantages), the possible treatment regimens (amount of stool sample, protocols to prepare the samples), the possible adverse events. - the references in the text should be changed with numbers, in addition, the citations numbers should be showed in the tables. - all tables in the manuscript are adopted, maybe the author should search trough PubMed and make his own data for tables.



ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 29234

Title: FECAL MICROBIAL TRANSPLANT FOR THE TREATMENT OF PEDIATRIC INFLAMMATORY BOWEL DISEASE

Reviewer’s code: 00503590

Reviewer’s country: Norway

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2016-08-05 11:02

Date reviewed: 2016-09-18 20:28

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The focus of the present manuscript is effects of FMT in pediatric IBD. In this area well designed and properly powered studies are particularly scant, and thus the review is based on four open label non-controlled case series with a total of 25 patients. Only one of these case series had more than clinical response as measure of effect - this totals 3 patients which were evaluated by endoscopy and histology. There are several ways this is problematic: - A major problem with case series in general is that only the successful cases are likely to be published - thus there is (potentially) a lot of unsuccessful cases that were never reported. - As the hype around FMT as a ?wonderdrug? is quite large, participants in case series and open label studies will probably be prone to report improvement in the follow-up. Therefore double-blinded RCTs are especially important, as the placebo-effect will be huge. - Harder endpoints than clinical scores (UCCS, partial MAYO etc) are also necessary, and endoscopic evaluation and a proper blinding protocol is very important. Looking over the presented tables, most of the studies mentioned are either solely based on clinical evaluation or do not have a control group, or both. Moving on to the only RCTs published in adult IBD, one study



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

did not show any difference between active and placebo, and the other showed a significant effect however the effect size was quite small and may represent a type I error. Taken together, these results are quite disappointing regarding further exploration of FMT effects in IBD. Based on the criticism above I feel that the conclusion is overly optimistic towards FMT in IBD. I truly support the need for well designed RCTs in this field.