



# BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

## ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 11541

**Title:** Novel insights into the mechanisms whereby isoflavones protect against fatty liver disease

**Reviewer code:** 02939850

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2014-05-27 21:22

**Date reviewed:** 2014-06-13 12:25

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. Introduction: Please provide the statistics about the increase of FLD. 2. Introduction: Please provide the specific reference(s) about the pharmacological agents for the prevention of FLD and side effects. 3. Please clarify the meaning of the toxic inflammatory cytokine. 4. Please cite the recent references about the "two hits" hypothesis. Also, as I know, there is an alternative "two hits" hypothesis in more recent publication(s). 5. Please double-check the reference numbers 27 and 28 and correct them if necessary.



### ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 11541

**Title:** Novel insights into the mechanisms whereby isoflavones protect against fatty liver disease

**Reviewer code:** 00009221

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2014-05-27 21:22

**Date reviewed:** 2014-06-17 18:36

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Authors suggest that isoflavones should be employed as protective agents for liver steatosis and steatohepatitis. The background and the experimental data reported are suggestive and in keeping with the hypothesis. However, some major revisions are necessary. 1-Introduction: the pathogenesis of ALD and NAFLD is different, even if some biochemical pathways are common. I think that the two aspects should be differently explained. 2- The observation that AR is induced in human livers obtained from patients with different chronic or acute liver damage doesn't indicate that AR may play an important role in the development of liver injuries. In other terms, in all the text, the relationships among different mechanisms not necessary document a cause-effect 3-also in the discussion there is a confusion about the effects of isoflavones in ALD and NAFLD. Also in this case, the documented actions of each isoflavone should be reported for ALD or NAFLD in different paragraph 4- Conclusions: authors are unable, on the basis of reported data, to conclude that " the supplement of isoflavones may be useful in preventing ALD and NAFLD/NASH". .... and provide a new therapeutic strategy for FLD patients ". Data on humans are very poor, without informations about the bioavailability, in vivo, of each of the substances reported, and in absence of well performed trials



# BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

## ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 11541

**Title:** Novel insights into the mechanisms whereby isoflavones protect against fatty liver disease

**Reviewer code:** 00199528

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2014-05-27 21:22

**Date reviewed:** 2014-06-24 22:29

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

authors have summarized the possible pathophysiological mechanisms that are mediated by inhibition of aldose reductase and are responsible from beneficial effects of isoflavones in fatty liver disease. the paper is a basic research with little clinical implication.



# BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

## ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 11541

**Title:** Novel insights into the mechanisms whereby isoflavones protect against fatty liver disease

**Reviewer code:** 00058403

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2014-05-27 21:22

**Date reviewed:** 2014-06-26 01:36

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

It is a review study, the subject is current and interesting. However, I have some considerations: In the title of the article, I suggest adding the information about the group to which limited this review: rodents. As the title of Table 1; There is no methodological description of how the review was conducted.



# BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

## ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 11541

**Title:** Novel insights into the mechanisms whereby isoflavones protect against fatty liver disease

**Reviewer code:** 02541357

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2014-05-27 21:22

**Date reviewed:** 2014-06-26 05:47

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript aims to review the literature about the mechanisms whereby isoflavones protect against fatty liver disease. The authors conducted an extensive and thorough review of the subject allowing the reader a good update. Suggestions: 1- The pathophysiology of nonalcoholic fatty liver disease should be updated. Other important points have emerged as microbiota, genetics, etc; 2 - the literature is limited to animal models, so we need more studies in order to affirm that it may represent a future treatment for fatty liver disease in humans.