



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 3671

Title: CHEMOPREVENTION OF HEPATOCELLULAR CARCINOMA IN PATIENTS WITH HCV - RELATED CIRRHOSIS

Reviewer code: 00004157

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-05-14 15:03

Date reviewed: 2013-05-14 21:41

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this paper, Authors reviewed the evidence concerning chemoprevention of hepatocellular carcinoma in patients with chronic HCV infection related cirrhosis, and present data relative to their personal experience. The available evidence is well summarized in the paper. Before publication, the paper would require: -extensive editing for english language and several typos -more accurate presentation of the available clinical evidence concerning chemopreventive trials in CHC cirrhosis, which I would report in a table with indication of the design of the study, clinical population, numerosity, type of intervention, and results -minor: steatosis and genetic factors have also been shown to influence CHC progression



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 3671

Title: CHEMOPREVENTION OF HEPATOCELLULAR CARCINOMA IN PATIENTS WITH HCV - RELATED CIRRHOSIS

Reviewer code: 00053485

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-05-14 15:03

Date reviewed: 2013-05-17 23:16

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this study, Testino et al. reviewed the impact of a small dose of IFN treatment in patients with HCV cirrhosis. Although the authors well summarized the topic, there are several unresolved issues in the current manuscript. Major Points 1. By adding table or figure, this review will be readable. 2. The cost-effectiveness of long-term interferon treatment is an important issue. This topic has to be discussed by referring following papers: Hepatology. 2012;55:49-57, Dig Dis Sci. 2009;54:690-4, J Hepatol. 1999;31 Suppl 1:255-8, Hepatology. 1995;22:1863-73. 3. Obesity and insulin resistance are also important topic and has to be discussed by referring following papers: Hepatology. 2003;38:639-44, Am J Pathol. 2004;165:1499-508, Hepatol Res. 2010;40:911-22. 4. Add the Conclusion section, at the end of this review. Minor Points 1. There is a typing error in the first line of the summary: "Hepatocellular Carcinoma" should be "hepatocellular carcinoma".



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 3671

Title: CHEMOPREVENTION OF HEPATOCELLULAR CARCINOMA IN PATIENTS WITH HCV - RELATED CIRRHOSIS

Reviewer code: 00502973

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-05-14 15:03

Date reviewed: 2013-05-20 09:15

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript titled "CHEMOPREVENTION OF HEPATOCELLULAR CARCINOMA IN PATIENTS WITH HCV -RELATED CIRRHOSIS" reviewed the current status of preventive effects of IFN in the onset of HCC in HCV infected cirrhotic patients. The authors also incorporated their own findings in this review article. This theme is clinical relevant and interesting. Yet, in general, the manuscript was not in good structure and written in poor English. There were many paragraphs consisting of only 1 short sentence. Some words were incorrectly spelt, e.g. asses, laboristic, clearly, et al. Some statement are not correct, e.g. "Response to therapy was evaluated in relation to virological response: sustained virological response (SVR) was defined as the absence of ALT activity within the reference range for at least 6 months after ; sustained biochemical response (SBR) was defined as a decrease in serum ALT activity to within the reference range but with reappearance or persistently detectable serum HCV-RNA; non-response (NR) was defined as persistence/relapse at the end of therapy of HCV-RNA and no decrease in ALT activity or relapse at the end of therapy (19)." Merely restoration of ALT activity is usually unable to be defined as sustained virological response (SVR) without any virological data. At last, in the authors' prospect, "it would be interesting to understand the possible role, in patients with HCV cirrhosis, of a small dose of weekly long life peginterferon or for a long period after treatment with peginterferon plus ribavirin." However, there were no evidence to support or capable of concluding such a statement.