



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road, Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6471

Title: Intestinal antigen-presenting cells in mucosal immune homeostasis: crosstalk between dendritic cells, macrophages and B-cells

Reviewer code: 01844002

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-10-22 13:40

Date reviewed: 2013-11-07 12:33

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript by Mann et al. provides timely review of antigen-presenting cell populations in the intestine. The review deals with the major lines of recent works comprehensively in a concise manner. I have no major issues with the manuscript.



ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6471

Title: Intestinal antigen-presenting cells in mucosal immune homeostasis: crosstalk between dendritic cells, macrophages and B-cells

Reviewer code: 00504169

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-10-22 13:40

Date reviewed: 2014-01-07 18:21

Table with 4 columns: CLASSIFICATION, LANGUAGE EVALUATION, RECOMMENDATION, CONCLUSION. It contains criteria for grades A through E and corresponding search results for Google and BPG.

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this review the authors emphasize the important role of cross talking between DCs, Macrophages and B cells in determining immunity and tolerance in the intestinal mucosa. However, in this review the various cell subsets are not precisely defined. In particular, it is lacking a clear description of defined conserved and divergent phenotypes and functions in human versus mice DC subsets (i.e. see the recent review by Watchmaker et al , " Comparative transcriptional and functional profiling defines conserved programs of intestinal DC differentiation in humans and mice" Nature Immunology 2014, 15 :98). As a consequence of that it is not clearly dissected the role of the different DC subsets in gut homeostasis. Moreover, in my opinion the role of different inflammasomes (i.e. NLRP3, NLRP6..) in this network of APC , intestinal homeostasis and IBD should also be reported and discussed.



ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6471

Title: Intestinal antigen-presenting cells in mucosal immune homeostasis: crosstalk between dendritic cells, macrophages and B-cells

Reviewer code: 00039143

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-10-22 13:40

Date reviewed: 2014-01-23 18:32

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this manuscript the authors give a detailed and simple description of the role of dendritic cell, macrophages and B-cell, as professional antigen presenting cells, both in the steady-state intestinal immunity and in IBD. The Authors go in detail highlighting mechanism used to monitoring intestinal immune tolerance in normal conditions and inappropriate responses of APC to microbiota contributing to IBD pathogenesis.