



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5228

Title: The role of mitochondrial DNA alterations and mitochondrial dysfunction in the progression of hepatocellular carcinoma cells

Reviewer code: 02438768

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-08-24 10:07

Date reviewed: 2013-10-02 18:33

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Comments for ESPS Manuscript NO: 5228 1) General comments: Hepatocellular carcinoma (HCC) is a leading cause of cancer-related death. This disease is strongly associated with several risk factors, however, the true mechanism of this cancer remains unknown. It is urgent to explore the mechanism of this cancer. There have been many reports of mitochondrial DNA (mtDNA) alterations associated with human malignancies. The topic of this manuscript is interesting, however, I have several points that the authors should consider. 2) Specific comments a) Major comments: # At present, our knowledge of the genomic alterations implicated in HCC initiation and progression is still fragmentary. The authors also stated in the Abstract "However, the role of these mtDNA alterations in the cancer progression is still unclear." Indeed, whether mtDNA alterations are correlated with progression remains controversial so far. Various researchers hold different opinions. Some researchers have suggested that mitochondrial dysfunction and especially dysfunctions caused by alterations of the mtDNA contribute to tumor progression, while other researchers regard the mtDNA alterations in tumors as hitchhike mutations. These should be analyzed together. Is mtDNA alteration a driving force or an indirect consequence of HCC progression? How to exclude those where such associations are non-causal epiphenomena? I hope that the authors should pay attention to these questions in the manuscript. #Biologically, structure and function of mitochondria are under the dual control of the mtDNA and the nuclear DNA(nDNA). The mechanism of nDNA mutagenesis involving the integration of mtDNA fragments may play an important role in tumor genesis and development. Therefore, it is necessary to discuss the interaction between mtDNA and nDNA in the manuscript. #I think that the manuscript is broad enough,



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

however, some perspective should be offered in the manuscript in regard to the role of mtDNA alterations and mitochondrial dysfunction in the progression of hepatocellular carcinoma cells. b)
Minor The minor comments are omitted.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5228

Title: The role of mitochondrial DNA alterations and mitochondrial dysfunction in the progression of hepatocellular carcinoma cells

Reviewer code: 00032198

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-08-24 10:07

Date reviewed: 2013-10-13 17:38

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This article reviews the potential roles of the alterations of mtDNA and mitochondrial dysfunction in the progression and metastasis of HCC that important for the development of novel treatments for HCC.