



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5775

Title: Culture-guided treatment approach for Helicobacter pylori infection: review of the literature data

Reviewer code: 00035741

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-09-26 18:19

Date reviewed: 2013-10-28 09:52

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a review article for culture-guided treatment approach for Helicobacter pylori infection. I am interested in it, however, some problems are listed below. 1. One of the biggest problems for difficulty of selecting culture method as a diagnosis of HP infection, is its high false negative rate. Authors should mention and discuss about it. 2. If culture-guided treatment approach is recommended to decide treatment regimen, treatment with many antimicrobials like sequential therapy could not be acceptable in resistant cases. Authors should make comment about it.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5775

Title: Culture-guided treatment approach for Helicobacter pylori infection: review of the literature data

Reviewer code: 00034993

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-09-26 18:19

Date reviewed: 2013-10-28 16:58

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this review, the authors reviewed the efficacy of H. pylori eradication therapy based on susceptibility of H. pylori to antimicrobial agents. However, authors failed to show benefit of tailored treatment based on susceptibility test. This review is well written. However, this version has any problems. Please revise carefully according to comments. Major comments: 1. At first, authors reviews role of antimicrobial agents to eradication therapy. However, this part is difficult to understand association with antimicrobial agents, susceptibility of H. pylori to antimicrobial agents, and eradication therapy. Authors should review these associations more detail, and add explanation of mechanism how to reveal resistance to H. pylori. At least, this part will be required for clarithromycin, metronidazole, amoxicillin and levofloxacin. 2. In section of 'culture against resistant H. pylori', authors reviewed any reports of tailored treatment based on susceptibility. However, it is unclear how to do tailored treatment based on susceptibility in each treatment. 3. There are two excellent reports to show an efficacy of tailored treatment based on susceptibility of H. pylori to antimicrobial agents from Japan. (1)Furuta T, et al. Clin Pharmacol Ther 2007;81:521-8 and (2) Kawai T, et al.. J Gastroenterol Hepatol 2008;23 Suppl 2:S171-4. Authors should add. 4. In the Maastricht IV consensus report, the treatment strategies of first-line eradication recommends to perform CAM-based and bismuth-containing quadruple treatment in areas of low prevalence of CAM resistance strain, and is recommended bismuth-containing quadruple treatment in areas of high resistance. If so, H. pylori eradication therapy based on susceptibility of H. pylori to antimicrobial agents may differ between areas of low prevalence of CAM resistance strain and high. 5. Authors should show optimal tailored eradication regimen in your opinion. Minor comments: 1.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

Please check a paper (Megraud F, et al. GUT 2013;62:34-42) and add as references. This paper showed prevalence of H. pylori resistant strain.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5775

Title: Culture-guided treatment approach for Helicobacter pylori infection: review of the literature data

Reviewer code: 00505471

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-09-26 18:19

Date reviewed: 2013-11-11 14:11

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper is a useful addition in information to all those dealing with treatment issues for resistant Helicobacter pylori. It is quite comprehensive in its coverage. However, the paper requires very extensive language editing before publication



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5775

Title: Culture-guided treatment approach for Helicobacter pylori infection: review of the literature data

Reviewer code: 01136482

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-09-26 18:19

Date reviewed: 2013-11-13 09:36

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The present review is updated and well written. Primary clarithromycin resistance markedly reduces Helicobacter pylori eradication rate following standard therapies. Prevalence of primary clarithromycin resistance in H. pylori is increasing, and three point mutations are mainly involved. High resistance rates were observed in Italian people (Di Francesco et al. J Gastrointestin Liver Dis. 2011). Please revise this point. The clinical impact and the cost/effectiveness analysis of the proposed strategy is not reported in the discussion section. Several double spaces are present in the text.