



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Radiology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8454

Title: Muscle and Vitamin D

Reviewer code: 00289470

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-12-28 19:36

Date reviewed: 2013-12-31 23:28

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this study, the authors focused on the role of imaging in vitamin D deficiency patients. The manuscript seems representative in its area, however there are some revisions to be made. Here is the point-by-point review list. ? The role of diagnostic imaging in investigating the specific effects of vitamin D on muscle function should be emphasized starting from the title, that could be rephrased simply as “The role of imaging in vitamin D deficiency patients”. ? The authors state that “By our group it has been shown that fatty degeneration of thigh muscles detected on MRI was associated with vitamin D deficiency and impaired balance and gait” A mention of the potential contribution to atrophy and muscular degeneration of other deficiencies of hormones that may impact the growth/trophism of skeletal muscle in the elderly would be appropriate. If it would be indeed the case, a brief overview of the role of diagnostic imaging in other hormonal deficiencies should be attempted. ? Some figures would help the readers in a full understanding of the role of imaging in vitamin D deficiency. ? The manuscript should be re-edited due to minor inaccuracies, i.e: clncal instead of clinical (pag. 5 line 3), reserch instead of research (pag. 5 line 4), muscels instead of muscles (pag. 5 line 15), “remember” instead of remember (pag. 5 line 18).



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Radiology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8454

Title: Muscle and Vitamin D

Reviewer code: 02348457

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-12-28 19:36

Date reviewed: 2014-01-02 09:35

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review focused on US/CT/MR imaging diagnosis in vitamin D deficiency imaging among elderly people. 1. The title is too simple to clearly summarize the content. It should be made more specific, more clear. 2. Author declare that he will focus on "Elderly people" who are prone to accidental falls and many fractures, but actually most of the data are relative to a wider population especially for athletes or younger than 65. 3. As a review, the author should provide more information of the same scope instead of focusing on only a few literatures. Specifically, one of reference was cited for 6 times, but the total reference papers were only 15. 4. The section "Skeletal Muscle" is covering a much bigger scope, and it occupied a large proportion of the paper, this section can be shorten and add a detailed muscle pathophysiological processes of vitamin D deficiency. 5. The section "ultrasound" is more like a general introduction about using US in muscle disease, but lack its advances in vitamin D deficiency imaging among elderly people. 6. More details about pathophysiological processes of vitamin D deficiency and its relationship with muscle diseases should be included. 7. After sections US/DEXA/MRI, the author should provide his own summery and bring redears the unique views for future directions. 8. A lot of studies had recently been reported to focus on US/CT/MR developments in vitamin D deficiency imaging, but only a few of these studies are included in the references.