



# Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,  
315-321 Lockhart Road,  
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 7228

**Title:** Metabolic syndrome and NAFLD in liver surgery: The new scourges?

**Reviewer code:** 00053562

**Science editor:** Zhai, Huan-Huan

**Date sent for review:** 2013-11-13 11:33

**Date reviewed:** 2013-11-14 07:06

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The entire manuscript must be revised to fix English grammar errors and the punctuation; although the topic is interesting, the reading results difficult for these two reasons. The abstract need a careful restyling: for instance, the first sentence "The aim of this topic highlight is to analyze the emerging evidence..." is not so correct nor fluent. Please clarify the abbreviation "HPB" in the abstract. Some statements, such as "NASH related cirrhosis is a rising etiology of end stage liver disease, potentially leading to transplantation" are far from being evidence based and even meaningful. The Core tip "There is an emerging evidence that the metabolic syndrome (MS) and its liver manifestation, the non-alcoholic fatty liver disease (NAFLD), are associated with the development of primary liver neoplasias and poor results of major liver surgery" is a collection of not well supported statements. The introduction is repetitive, please make it more fluent and realistic and less catastrophic: "NAFLD liver histopathological alterations range from simple steatosis to steatohepatitis, to fibrosis and may end up in true cirrhosis leading to end stage liver disease, potentially needing transplantation". The aims of the review: "1 The objectives of this review are therefore to provide comprehensive insights regarding the current standards and issues in the diagnosis of both MS and NAFLD, 2 to clarify their respective impact on tumor progression as well as 3 their influence on postoperative outcome. Finally, 4 the issue of the measures that should be undertaken in upcoming years in order to improve the results of surgery are addressed ?". Please, check how these four aims of this review are developed. The sentence "In fact, histological alterations (NAFLD) may also rise in patients presenting with individual components of the MS including diabetes mellitus (DM), hypertriglyceridemia and obesity" must be reformulated. The topic of the paragraph is the metabolic syndrome and, after a brief introduction and definition, this sentence must be better linked to the previous one. "Histological



## Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,  
315-321 Lockhart Road,  
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

---

alteration" is too generic and the word "NAFLD" in parentheses doesn't clarify the concept. I suggest to change it for example with "Histological liver alteration" or simply "Fatty liver disease".

Section Metabolic syndrome In the sentence "Interestingly, most of the studies including retrospective medical and surgical literature do not always gather all these consensual criteria but rather use substitutes for commodity", I think that the word commodity is used instead of the colloquial Italian "comodità", but the real meaning is another one. So I suggest to modify and substitute it with "for convenience".

SECTION NON-ALCOHOLIC FATTY LIVER DISEASE (NAFLD) In the sentence "NAFLD has emerged as one of the most frequent forms of chronic liver disease in Western countries and should be considered in case of steatotic infiltration exceeding 5% of liver parenchyma at histology in the absence of previous or ongoing significant alcohol consumption"; I suggest to substitute "steatotic infiltration" with "fatty infiltration".

SECTION NON-ALCOHOLIC STEATOHEPATITIS (NASH) In the sentence "Moreover, NAS does not include other histologic alterations often present in NAFLD, such as microcirculation modifications, which are not routinely reported by pathologists and whose role in progression from MS to NAFLD still have to be defined.." the word "not" is often repeated, please fix it. "Interestingly, Brunt et al. have emphasized that the diagnosis of NASH based on evaluation of patterns as well as individual lesions on liver biopsies did not always correlated with threshold values of the semi quantitative NAS. Moreover, NAS does not include other histologic alterations often present in NAFLD, such as microcirculation modifications, which are not not routinely reported by pathologists and whose role in progression from MS to NAFLD still have to be



# Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,  
315-321 Lockhart Road,  
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 7228

**Title:** Metabolic syndrome and NAFLD in liver surgery: The new scourges?

**Reviewer code:** 01220634

**Science editor:** Zhai, Huan-Huan

**Date sent for review:** 2013-11-13 11:33

**Date reviewed:** 2013-11-27 16:57

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Interesting review. Famous team. Expert team of the field. Suggestions: Page 7 : Delete the sentence : "Although false positive may be recorded,[32] histological analysis remains the gold standard for the assessment of NAFLD by using the non-alcoholic liver disease activity score (NAS) proposed by Kleiner et al.[25] " The diagnosis must be done by a trained pathologist as written in the next part of the manuscript. Published scores can be useful for the diagnosis (Brunts classification, Bedossa's classification-Please add the reference : Hepatology. 2012 Nov;56(5):1751-9. doi: 10.1002/hep.25889. Histopathological algorithm and scoring system for evaluation of liver lesions in morbidly obese patients. Bedossa P, Poitou C, Veyrie N, Bouillot JL, Basdevant A, Paradis V, Tordjman J, Clement K.) or to follow patients but not for the diagnosis (NAS). This must be added in the paper. Table 1: Change "Other inappropriately used criteria" this is true only for parameters associated with the central obesity. For the other parameters, precise that treatments must be taken in account except if given in preemptive purpose(s).



# Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,  
315-321 Lockhart Road,  
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 7228

**Title:** Metabolic syndrome and NAFLD in liver surgery: The new scourges?

**Reviewer code:** 00068215

**Science editor:** Zhai, Huan-Huan

**Date sent for review:** 2013-11-13 11:33

**Date reviewed:** 2013-11-29 18:11

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Regarding the manuscript entitled "Metabolic syndrome and NAFLD in liver surgery: The new scourges?", there are some minor comments: 1. This manuscript comes at a time where several publications exist in the literature on this topic; therefore, the authors need to emphasize the novelty and impact of their articles to be considered for publication. 2 The authors could include in their review also the recent paper by Fierbinteanu et al, Journal of Physiology and Pharmacology, 2013, 64, 1, 3-9, which showed the major health impact of NAFLD.



## Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,  
315-321 Lockhart Road,  
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

### ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 7228

**Title:** Metabolic syndrome and NAFLD in liver surgery: The new scourges?

**Reviewer code:** 00872320

**Science editor:** Zhai, Huan-Huan

**Date sent for review:** 2013-11-13 11:33

**Date reviewed:** 2013-11-29 20:43

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review by Cauchy and coworkers is based on few data available in the literature and I do not think it is time to publish a review on this topic. We have to wait new well designed study in order to be able to develop metanalysis of the data. The only "new" things are the one reported in Table 2. I don't think this paper is suitable for publication on WJG