

First published: August 31, 2020

# Guidelines for editing review articles in the editor

### **1 PREPARATORY WORK FOR REVISING YOUR MANUSCRIPT**

**1.1 Take the manuscript writing seriously:** Every section, from title to references, including tables and figures, must be carefully checked and revised, as this is an important part of scientific research. Author(s) should embrace the spirit of writing, rewriting, and repeatedly re-rewriting the manuscript, as this is key to producing a high-quality publication the will support the authors' careers and professional reputations as well as the overall development and advancement of their fields.

**1.2 Appreciate the significance of publishing a review article:** A review article is a comprehensive and reliable analysis and detailed and systematic exposition of the research history, current situation, progress, and future trend of a certain field or research topic. Its purpose is to draw structural, trend, forward-looking, and guiding conclusions and to reasonably point out existing problems and future research directions. Most review articles are written by leading or distinguished experts in a field or industry<sup>[1]</sup>.

**1.3 Rethink the manuscript:** In order to write a high-quality review article, the author(s) first need(s) to think about the following content requirements: (1) Your comprehensive review and critical assessment of the literature relevant to an important topic; (2) Your criteria for selecting and omitting articles to include in the review; (3) Your synthesis of the ideas other investigators in the field have generated; and (4) Your disciplined scientific perspective – based on the preponderance of the evidence – on the status of the research and its findings, and the direction that research must now take to advance



knowledge in the field<sup>[2]</sup>.

1.4 Answer the peer-review report with a rational and open-minded perspective: Author(s) should be able to answer all reasonable queries and revise the manuscript in accordance with the comments and advice of peer reviewers.

1.5 Manuscript writing skills: For the whole manuscript: (1) Do not introduce new information at the beginning of a sentence. Start with old information and gradually move on to new information; (2) Avoid using undefined non-public terms, and explain or define them when they first appear to help editors, reviewers, and readers to understand them; and (3) Use transition sentences wisely. At the beginning of a paragraph, there should be a sentence illustrating the main topic of the whole paragraph. At the end of the paragraph, there should be a transitional sentence leading to the next paragraph. Make sure that both the transitional sentence and involved paragraphs are logically connected.

**1.6 Academic misconduct:** It is unethical to copy text (*i.e.* descriptive phrasing, sentences) from any previously published document. Author(s) should cite the published literature correctly. BPG will subject the final manuscript CrossCheck screening to detect any such academic misconduct.

## **2 TEXT STRUCTURE**

The structure of a review article includes: (1) INTRODUCTION: Mainly describe the purpose and function of the review and summarize the concepts and definitions related to the theme; (2) MAIN BODY (with topic-specifying headings (bolded, capitalized and underlined) and subheadings (bolded, sentence case and italicized)): This section is usually divided into several large parts based on the amount of content; the



topic-specifying heading(s) should be short and eye-catching; and (3) <u>CONCLUSION</u>: Summarize the full text, give future perspectives, put forward reasoned opinions and suggestions, and point out the future development trend<sup>[1]</sup>.

#### **3 TEXT WRITING**

The text should be grammatically correct, succinct, and logical. The main points of writing each section include: (1) <u>INTRODUCTION</u>: Briefly describe the historical background, development process, research status, controversy, application value, and practical significance of the selected theme<sup>[1]</sup>; (2) MAIN BODY: Discuss, in a logical order, the questions, principles, methods, arguments, time, and stages of development for the review's topic<sup>[1]</sup>. For each study, critically evaluate the following information: (A) The key findings; (B) The limitations and/or shortfalls, if any; (C) Whether the methods are sound for evaluating the hypothesis; (D) Whether the results can be obtained with those methods and are justified; (E) Whether the interpretation of the results and the conclusions drawn are sound; and (F) The relative contribution of the work to the field or topic being reviewed<sup>[2]</sup>; and (3) <u>CONCLUSION</u>: Summarize the full text, give future perspectives, put forward reasoned opinions and suggestions, and point out the future development trend; make a brief summary of the main content of the text, and put forward the author's own views, indicating what the author is for and against<sup>[1]</sup>.

#### **4 ABBREVIATIONS**

It is necessary to standardize the use of non-public abbreviations and explain or define them when they first appear to help editors, reviewers, and readers to understand them.

#### **5 FIGURES AND TABLES**

The figure legends, figures, tables, and table notes should be presented on separate pages at the end of the manuscript. The authors should create vector graphics and



images using Microsoft PowerPoint to ensure that all graphs or text portions can be reprocessed by the journal's editor. The most common issues encountered on reference citation, types, and content presentation for figures and tables are as follows:

**Issues raised 1:** Figures and tables should be cited in ascending numeric order at first appearance in the manuscript file. Please verify the number and order of in-text citations of figures and tables to avoid out-of-order or missing citations.

**Issues raised 2:** Please check the text format in the figures and tables. Capitalize the first letter of a sentence and lowercase the rest, except for special phrases.

**Issues raised 3:** Prepare Microsoft Excel or Word tables as three-line tables. Carriage returns or spaces are not allowed to be used for replacing lines. Only top/bottom lines and column line are displayed, and other lines should be hidden. Sub-tables are not allowed within tables, *e.g.*, Table 1A and Table 1B. Tables in picture format are unacceptable.

**Issues raised 4:** Uniform presentation should be used for figures showing the same or similar contents (using uppercase lettered panels); for example: **"Figure 1 Pathological changes of atrophic gastritis after treatment.** A: ...; B: ...; C: ...; D: ...; E: ...; F: ...; G: ..."

**Issues raised 5:** Note the correct use of spaces; for example, there is no space before or after a hyphen. Please change 3(1 - 5) to 3 (1-5). Otherwise, spaces are required before numbers. Please change  $\ge 20$  to  $\ge 20$ .

**Issues raised 6:** Please use the decimal point, counting symbol, *etc*. correctly; for example, please change 30,25% to 30.25%, and 12,000 or 12 000 patients to 12000 patients.



**Issues raised 7:** Please use n (%) correctly. For example, for data presented in the cells of a column or row denoting n (%), please change 55 (10.3%) to 55 (10.3).

**Issues raised 8:** For notes in illustrations and tables, data with statistical significance in a figure or table should be denoted using superscripted alphabetical lettering, such as  ${}^{a}P < 0.05$  and  ${}^{b}P < 0.01$ . If there are other series of *P* values, the alphabetical subscripted denotation format is continued, such as  ${}^{c}P < 0.05 vs$  control,  ${}^{d}P < 0.01 vs$  control,  ${}^{e}P < 0.05 vs$  group A, and  ${}^{f}P < 0.01 vs$  group B. Data that are not statistically significant should not be denoted, *i.e. P* > 0.05 is not an allowed denotation. In statistical processing, mean ± standard deviation is expressed as mean ± SD and mean ± standard error as mean ± SE. Special symbols, such as #, \*, &, and ¥, are not permitted to be present in tables.

**Issues raised 9:** Please verify the abbreviations used in figures and tables and define them (in alphabetical order, separated by semicolons, with first letter capitalized) at the end of the figure legend or table, *e.g.*, BMI: Body mass index; CT: Computed tomography.

**Issues raised 10:** Please address the following special requirements for figures. Figures must be presented in the order that they appear in the main text of the manuscript (numbered as Figure 1, Figure 2, Figure 3, *etc.*). Please verify that each of the figures are referred to in the text by their respective Roman numerals and that the numbering order is correct and the format is correct. The requirements for the figures and figure legends include: (A) All submitted figures, including the text contained within the figures, must be editable. Please provide the text in your figure(s) in text boxes; (B) For line drawings that were automatically generated with software, please provide the labels/values of the ordinate and abscissa in text boxes; (C) Please prepare and arrange the figures using PowerPoint to ensure that all graphs or text portions can be reprocessed by the journal's



editor; and (D) In consideration of color-blind readers, please avoid using red and green for contrast in vector graphics or images.

**Issues raised 11:** Please address the following special requirements for tables. Tables must be presented in the order that they appear in the main text of the manuscript (numbered as Table 1, Table 2, Table 3, *etc.*). Please verify that each of the tables is referred to in the text by their respective Roman numerals and that the numbering order is correct and the format is correct. Please verify that the spacing is correct, with no missing or multiple spaces, *e.g.*, before or after parentheses, between words, or before or after symbols like +, ×, ±, <, >, ≥, and ≤. Please verify that the special words or letters are correct, *e.g.*, *P* (uppercase), *n* (lowercase), *via*, *vs* (lowercase, no punctuation), *in vivo*, *in vitro*, and *et al* (no punctuation) are italicized.

**Issues raised 12:** Please ensure the figures and tables in the supplemental materials are placed together to make a separate document, and cited in the text in the correct order. The preparation of supplementary figures and tables should follow the same standard as the preparation of figures and tables in the manuscript.

## **6 REFERENCE CITATION**

The authors are responsible for accuracy and completeness of their references and for correct in-text citation. The in-text citation of references should occur in ascending numerical order upon first appearance in the Main Text of the manuscript file. No references should be present in the Abstract, Core tip, or Article Highlights. The most common issues encountered on reference citation format and reference list format are as follows:

**Issues raised 1:** T The "reference numbering system" should be adopted; that is, the Arabic number of references will be arranged in ascending order according to the order



they appear in the text, and the reference number will be indicated with square brackets, superscripted, inside the punctuation of the content-appropriate text where it is cited. **Example 1:** In "Other studies have reported lower hospital mortalities and intubation complication rates for helmet-based NIV than for oronasal mask-based NIV in cases of acute respiratory failure7-9 or (7-9)", the "7-9" or "(7-9)" citation should be changed to "...failure<sup>[7-9]</sup>" with superscript format.

**Example 2:** "Length, diameter and radial expansive force after deployment was modeled<sup>[1,18,22-25]</sup>."

**Issues raised 2:** There is no space after a comma "," in a reference citation. For [1, 2] reference citation, please delete all spaces after "," and format <sup>[1,2]</sup> as superscript.

**Issues raised 3:** It is incorrect if the reference numbers in a reference citation are not numbered in ascending order. For [1,4,2] reference citation, please change to <sup>[1,2,4]</sup> and format as superscript.

**Issues raised 4:** For in-text citations including authors' names, please use the first author's name followed by *et al* when there are more than two authors, *e.g.*, Larssen *et al*<sup>[28]</sup>.

**Issues raised 5:** There is no need to use a hyphen between two consecutive references. Please change [1-2] to <sup>[1,2]</sup> and format as superscript.

**Issues raised 6:** A hyphen is required when three or more references are cited in succession. Please change <sup>[1,2,3,4]</sup> to <sup>[1-4]</sup>.

Issues raised 7: No space is allowed between a textual word and the reference number.



Please change "world <sup>[1,2]</sup>" to "world<sup>[1,2]</sup>".

**Issues raised 8:** Please verify that each in-text reference number is arranged in ascending order and delete any duplicate reference citations.

Issues raised 9: Please ensure the PubMed identification numbers and DOI citation numbers are present in the reference list and all authors of each referenced paper are listed for it. Please revise throughout. The PMID is required, and NOT the PMCID; the PMID number can be found at https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov. (The information "PMID: ") The can should begin with DOI number be found at http://www.crossref.org/SimpleTextQuery/. (The information should begin with "DOI: 10.\*\*").

**Issues raised** For PMID and DOI numbers of references from English-language journals, please ensure there is a space between the PMID and DOI numbers in the square brackets. Do not add [] to the numbering of references or add any symbol at the end of PMID and DOI numbers.

**Example: Antoniou SA**, Kohler G, Antoniou GA, Muysoms FE, Pointner R, Granderath FA. Meta-analysis of randomized trials comparing nonpenetrating vs mechanical mesh fixation in laparoscopic inguinal hernia repair. *Am J Surg* 2016; **211**: 239-249 [PMID: 26316363 DOI: 10.1016/j.amjsurg.2015.06.008]

**Issues raised 11:** Please avoid references without PMID or DOI number, except for WHO guidelines and book references. When such a reference must be cited, please provide the full web address.

**Example: Cannon R.** Rilonacept to improve artery function in patients with atherosclerosis. [accessed 2015 Apr 25]. In: ClinicalTrials.gov [Internet]. Bethesda (MD):



U.S. National Library of Medicine. ClinicalTrials.gov Identifier: NCT00417417. Available from: <u>http://clinicaltrials.gov/show/NCT00417417</u>.

**Issues raised 12:** For PMID and DOI numbers of references from Chinese-language journals, please add a space between the PMID and DOI numbers in the square brackets. The name of the Chinese-language journal cited should be written in Chinese Pinyin according to each word, with the first letter of each word capitalized and all words italicized.

**Example: Zhang ZM,** Deng H, Zhang C, Yu HW, Liu Z, Liu LM, Wan BJ, Zhu MW. Strategies for diagnosis and treatment of benign and malignant colorectal obstruction. *Shijie Huaren Xiaohua Zazhi* 2017; 25: 2597-2604 [DOI: 10.11569/wcjd.v25.i29.2597]

## **7 REFERENCES**

1 Dr. Liang's Lecture Hall, public account. 2020-07-12

2 Derish PA, Annesley TM. How to write a rave review. Clin Chem 2011; 57:388-391