



**ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Psychiatry

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 31143

**Title:** Attention-deficit/hyperactivity disorder and suicide: A systematic review

**Reviewer’s code:** 00632509

**Reviewer’s country:** Croatia

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2016-11-02 21:09

**Date reviewed:** 2016-11-16 18:42

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

This is a nicely written review on the association of ADHD and suicidality. In addition to collecting data from 2011 -2015, the authors also answered to the extra questions: the instruments used for the diagnoses of ADHD, suicidality and comorbid conditions, the prevalence of ADHD among suicidal patients / prevalence of suicidality among ADHD patients, the gender differences in suicidality and ADHD, and how comorbid ADHD and other psychiatric disorders influence suicidality. They found 26 articles, and detected a positive association between ADHD and suicidality in both sexes and in all age groups; the data suggested that comorbid disorders mediate suicidality and ADHD, and the authors concluded that ADHD is related to high suicidality in all age groups, in both genders, and for the prevention of suicide, early recognition and treatment of ADHD (either as a comorbid condition or as a main diagnosis), and the co-occurring psychiatric disorders, has an important role; therefore clinician should incorporate routine measurements of suicidality in the daily practice of ADHD clinics. I have no major comments, and I have only found a few spelling errors, such as that the authors start the sentence with a capital letter after a colon, for example: “The selective review paper of Nigg (2013) had a wider focus: He overviewed the current....” This should be corrected



## BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

---

throughout the text. Please correct "backgrounds" into "backgrounds" throughout the text. Please correct these sentences ( delete " as well"): "One of the theoretical backgrounds of it is the construct of impulsivity, which is a well-known personality trait. Impulsivity is a core symptom of ADHD (American Psychiatric Association, 2013; World Health Organization, 1993), moreover it is known that it correlates to suicidal behavior (Brezo et al., 2006). Another theoretical background behind the possible association between ADHD and suicide is that two-thirds of ADHD cases have at least one comorbid psychiatric diagnosis, which is most often conduct disorder, substance use or a major depressive episode (Balazs and Gadoros, 2005; Biederman et al., 1991; MTA Cooperative Group, 1999)..." Please delete "exactly" from this statement: "These comorbid disorders are well-known risk factors of suicide.."

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Psychiatry

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 31143

**Title:** Attention-deficit/hyperactivity disorder and suicide: A systematic review

**Reviewer's code:** 00551176

**Reviewer's country:** Hungary

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2016-11-02 21:09

**Date reviewed:** 2016-11-25 02:08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Balazs J and Kereszteny A: Attention-Deficit/Hyperactivity Disorder and Suicide: A Systematic Review This is manuscript is a systematic literature review of the last four years, exploring the connection between ADHD and suicidal behavior. The topic is relevant, in the last decade increasing attention is focused on ADHD and related issues. Authors put the following research questions: a) the instruments used for the diagnoses of ADHD, suicidality and comorbid conditions b) the prevalence of ADHD among suicidal patients / prevalence of suicidality among ADHD patients c) the gender differences in suicidality and ADHD d) how comorbid ADHD and other psychiatric disorders influence suicidality. The literature review is accurately done, found data are correctly reported. A minor shortcoming of the review, that only English and Hungarian papers were included and as Figure 1 shows three relevant studies were excluded because they were not in English (and supposedly not in Hungarian, but it is not indicated). Inclusion of these studies would have increased the value of the review. Minor comment: The style of the reference list is not uniform.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Psychiatry

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 31143

**Title:** Attention-deficit/hyperactivity disorder and suicide: A systematic review

**Reviewer's code:** 03613726

**Reviewer's country:** Australia

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2016-11-02 21:09

**Date reviewed:** 2016-11-21 10:33

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors have reviewed the evidence for an association between ADHD and suicide. This is a descriptive review that does not include meta-analysis. The study concept has merit but as it stands it has a number of problems, including the following: Aims - the authors have listed 5 separate aims, several of which are not really of great relevance, other than as discussion points about potential limitations eg the assessments used. I would suggest the following aims: a) whether suicide is more prevalent in people with ADHD b) whether ADHD is more common in people who are suicidal c) investigating other identifiable risk factors associated with suicide in ADHD Methodology - the search strategy seems appropriate, but the selection criteria are not adequately specified and raise questions: a) the substantial selection bias inherent in selecting the languages of English and Hungarian - how might this have biased the findings? b) what is meant by the exclusion of suicidal behaviour related to the pharmacological treatment of patients with ADHD? Does this mean that the included cohorts were treated? Or untreated? Would it not have been better to state that the treatment status of many cohorts was unknown and to therefore include the treatment studies, combining the treated-untreated patients to get a mean percentage? Or were these excluded because



## BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

---

there was no non-ADHD control group? Was a non-ADHD comparison group one of the inclusion criteria? Results - The results as they stand are very difficult to read and really just duplicate the information given in the table. The table is informative but unfortunately the studies are listed alphabetically (!) rather than being classified according to methodology. I would suggest classifying them into 2 main categories: those looking at suicide rate in ADHD and those looking at ADHD in those with suicide. Then classify suicide into: completed suicide, attempted suicide, suicidal ideation - ie 3 different categories of suicide. The confounders in the different studies are diverse and I would suggest combining the co-morbid diagnoses into a single category and then doing meta-analysis. The breakdown of the different diagnoses would obviously be given in an explanatory paragraph. Discussion - This is poorly written and I suggest re-structuring as described in Docherty M, Smith R. The case for structuring the discussion of scientific papers. *BMJ* 1999;318(7193):1224-5. The discussion should focus on the actual findings of clinical relevance, which I suggest relate to the above aims.