



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4010

Title: KIT-negative GIST of stomach in which DOG1 staining was useful for diagnosis

Reviewer code: 02537158

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-06-08 19:48

Date reviewed: 2013-07-14 05:39

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript "KIT-negative GIST of stomach in which DOG1 staining was useful for diagnosis" by Wada et al. describes a characterization of a c-kit negative GIST of stomach presenting a positive staining for DOG1, which was useful for the final diagnosis. The manuscript is interesting for those of the field and has good results for the clinical area. However, some minor points should be revised before the manuscript is considered accept for publication, such as a more "scientific" style. The title should be more concise for the readers. In several parts of the text, few modifications in the written style should be performed, especially on the abstract (the first phrase should be re-written). A good english review should also be performed. In conclusion, I believe that the manuscript has a great potential for publication after the written style improvement.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4010

Title: KIT-negative GIST of stomach in which DOG1 staining was useful for diagnosis

Reviewer code: 00207239

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-06-08 19:48

Date reviewed: 2013-07-14 10:30

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

KIT-negative GIST with positive immunostaining for DOG1 is not a new concept now, we are more interested in the underlying mechanism or the correlation of biomarker and clinical elements. I have to reject this article.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4010

Title: KIT-negative GIST of stomach in which DOG1 staining was useful for diagnosis

Reviewer code: 02151749

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-06-08 19:48

Date reviewed: 2013-07-21 22:15

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This case report described that DOG1-staining could be a pathological diagnostic aid for c-Kit-negative GIST. The text was generally well-written. One minor concern is that little was described about the character of D842V PDGFA mutation found in the patient. Because the mutant form is resistant to imatinib similar to D816V c-Kit, this reviewer requests the authors to discuss a therapeutic option for this patient when recurrence is found. Minor point; 1. Page 6. Line 17. "A useful antibody" should be a useful molecule. 2. Figures 3 and 4 require high resolution images.,