



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Psychiatry*

Manuscript NO: 100431

Title: Predictive value of nutritional status and serological indicators in elderly patients with mild cognitive impairment

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 07915690

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, Doctor, Doctor

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: United States

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2024-09-06

Reviewer chosen by: AI Editor

Reviewer accepted review: 2024-09-09 00:44

Reviewer performed review: 2024-09-16 15:21

Review time: 7 Days and 14 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation



Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this paper the authors provide evidence that old age, hypertension, diabetes, hyperlipidemia, smoking, high-salt diet, high-cholesterol diet, decreased RBC, increased NLR and increased LDL-C were risk factors for the onset of MCI. High vitamin diet and elevated HDL-C were protective factors. The study involved a robust sample of 296 elderly patients who were hospitalized for memory loss, ensuring a diverse and relevant cohort. The thorough collection of demographic, clinical, and serological data adds depth to the analysis and allows for a multifaceted exploration of risk factors. The use of both univariate and multivariate logistic regression models provides a detailed examination of the factors influencing MCI. This dual approach enhances the reliability of the findings by addressing both individual and combined effects of various risk factors. What’s more, The creation of a clinical prediction model using ROC curves and nomograms is a notable strength of the study. This model not only forecasts the likelihood of MCI but also offers practical tools for clinical application. The use of AUC values and calibration curves to evaluate the model’s accuracy demonstrates a commitment to ensuring its practical utility and precision. It is important that they have



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: office@baishideng.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

identified that early identification of high-risk individuals for MCI can better intervene and improve the quality of life of MCI patients. The manuscript is well-organized and the topic is of great significance. Overall, this study makes a significant contribution to understanding MCI risk factors and developing a predictive model. However, there are several places need to be improved. 1) Further research into the mechanisms through which identified risk factors influence MCI could enhance the clinical relevance of the findings and support targeted interventions. 2) Incorporating longitudinal follow-up in future studies could enhance understanding of how risk factors evolve over time and their impact on the progression of MCI. 3) The model's applicability across different populations and settings should be tested to ensure its generalizability. Including diverse ethnic and geographic groups could provide a more comprehensive evaluation of the model's accuracy.



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Psychiatry*

Manuscript NO: 100431

Title: Predictive value of nutritional status and serological indicators in elderly patients with mild cognitive impairment

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 07915717

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, Doctor, Doctor

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Spain

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2024-09-06

Reviewer chosen by: AI Editor

Reviewer accepted review: 2024-09-10 11:41

Reviewer performed review: 2024-09-17 12:18

Review time: 7 Days

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation



Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This study represents a comprehensive effort to identify and analyze risk factors for Mild Cognitive Impairment (MCI) among the elderly and to construct a predictive model for clinical use. The inclusion of a well-defined cohort from Wuxi People's Hospital and the detailed analysis of various demographic, clinical, and serological factors add significant value to the existing literature on MCI. The study's methodology, including the use of both univariate and multivariate logistic regression models, and the development of a prediction model through ROC curves and nomograms, underscores the robustness and sophistication of the approach. The employment of the Montreal Cognitive Assessment Scale (MoCA) for categorization and the use of ROC curves and nomograms for the prediction model are both well-established methodologies that strengthen the study's validity. In addition, The identification of several risk factors for MCI, including old age, hypertension, diabetes, hyperlipidemia, smoking, and dietary habits, provides valuable insights for both clinical practice and future research. Overall this is a strong paper and the results presented are novel and important. The manuscript is well-organized and the topic is of great significance. I have a few comments to help



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: office@baishideng.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

clarify some parts of the study: -In the statistical analyses of method section, please report how the normality was tested in continuous variables. What's more, please clarify whether the t-test is one-tailed or two-tailed. -I would suggest to adopt a unified form for the description of P-values in the text. For example, in the first paragraph of the result, the authors used "P