



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Experimental Medicine

ESPS manuscript NO: 13487

Title: Barriers in contribution of human mesenchymal stem cells to murine muscle regeneration

Reviewer's code: 00503926

Reviewer's country: Brazil

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2014-08-26 17:06

Date reviewed: 2014-10-01 02:51

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors demonstrated, here, that fresh murine muscle tissue provides a suboptimal environment for maintenance of human mesenchymal stem cells (hMSC) and that in in vivo mouse models their capacity to engage in myoregeneration is underestimated. Additionally they found that the added value of the present model is that it permits the dissection of species-specific factors in the microenvironment. Thus, the broader application of this model requires the development of improved methods to cryopreserve satellite cells in human skeletal muscle. So, this study was well-organized and well-investigated. I have no claim in the present manuscript.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Experimental Medicine

ESPS manuscript NO: 13487

Title: Barriers in contribution of human mesenchymal stem cells to murine muscle regeneration

Reviewer's code: 00503926

Reviewer's country: Brazil

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2014-08-26 17:06

Date reviewed: 2014-10-01 02:51

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors demonstrated, here, that fresh murine muscle tissue provides a suboptimal environment for maintenance of human mesenchymal stem cells (hMSC) and that in in vivo mouse models their capacity to engage in myoregeneration is underestimated. Additionally they found that the added value of the present model is that it permits the dissection of species-specific factors in the microenvironment. Thus, the broader application of this model requires the development of improved methods to cryopreserve satellite cells in human skeletal muscle. So, this study was well-organized and well-investigated. I have no claim in the present manuscript.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Experimental Medicine

ESPS manuscript NO: 13487

Title: Barriers in contribution of human mesenchymal stem cells to murine muscle regeneration

Reviewer's code: 00504030

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2014-08-26 17:06

Date reviewed: 2014-09-16 15:45

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The study conducted by Garza-Rodea et al described a murine model using subcutaneous implants of minced muscle for examining the regeneration of damaged human and murine skeletal muscle implants and the contribution of added corresponding human and mouse mesenchymal stem cells. The authors concluded that 1) the contribution of human mesenchymal stem cells to murine myofiber formation was restricted to the cryopreserved mouse muscle implants suggesting that fresh murine muscle tissue provided a suboptimal environment for the maintenance of human mesenchymal stem cells; 2) their described model allowed the dissection of species-specific factors in the microenvironment. The authors commented that the application of their described model requires the development of improved methods to cryopreserve satellite cells in human skeletal muscle. In general, the study seems well-designed and carefully conducted. The research rationale was clear and the research question was driven by practical experimental needs. Appropriate methods were adopted in the process of data collection. The manuscript was overall well-written in adequate detail. This Reviewer has provided the following minor suggestions for further improvement of the



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

manuscript. 1) Title needs to be revised to accurately state murine and human tissues are examined in this study. "Species barriers" appears to cover many different species but the present study examined only murine and human muscle tissues. 2) The issue of cell cryopreservation appears to be critical in the described model system. This issue needs to be further discussed in full details in the Discussion section. 3) There are grammatical mistakes throughout the manuscript. Please conduct a careful check on the use of English throughout the entire manuscript. 4) The resolution of most of the figure pictures is not acceptable for publication purpose. Please provide pictures with better resolution.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Experimental Medicine

ESPS manuscript NO: 13487

Title: Barriers in contribution of human mesenchymal stem cells to murine muscle regeneration

Reviewer's code: 00504024

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2014-08-26 17:06

Date reviewed: 2014-10-08 21:00

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This paper can be acceptable if authors revise. 1. If you use immunosuppressant, can it overcome species difference? 2. What is effect of irradiation on the stem cells to overcome species-specific barrier?