



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 44891

Title: Iron and liver fibrosis: Mechanistic and clinical aspects

Reviewer's code: 02439220

Reviewer's country: Australia

Science editor: Ruo-Yu Ma

Date sent for review: 2018-12-03

Date reviewed: 2018-12-11

Review time: 8 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a well written review on iron and liver disease. It outlines clearly current knowledge on the underlying basic mechanisms of action of iron in the development of fibrosis in a range of chronic liver diseases. Minor comments to be addressed. 1) Table 2 and p12 There are inconsistencies in the data in Table 2, p12 and Ref 7. In Table 2 "Iron



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

level/accumulation" in "Normal" Total iron in body range is listed as 3-4 g not 3-5 g as given in cited Ref 7. In Table 2 "Hereditary Haemochromatosis"can reach up to 25-30 g. This is the hepatic iron level as stated in Ref 7 and p12 not total iron. I suggest that both total body and hepatic iron levels for Normal and Hereditary Haemochromatosis subjects are included in Table 2. 2) p13 para 1. Correct LP-repair-mechanism to LPC-repair-mechanism. 3) p22 Add LPC to Abbreviations. 4) References are not formatted correctly. Check instructions to authors for details.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 44891

Title: Iron and liver fibrosis: Mechanistic and clinical aspects

Reviewer's code: 03648851

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Ruo-Yu Ma

Date sent for review: 2018-12-03

Date reviewed: 2018-12-28

Review time: 25 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review presents very interesting opinion on the relationship between iron and hepatic manifestation that are clearly of broad interest and deserve publication. Thus, the paper is an important contribution and I recommend that it be accepted for publication.



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No