



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Hepatology*

Manuscript NO: 91355

Title: Hepatocellular carcinoma immune microenvironment and Check point inhibitors-Current status

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 04555234

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Doctor, Research Fellow

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: India

Manuscript submission date: 2023-12-27

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-12-29 22:19

Reviewer performed review: 2024-01-03 01:28

Review time: 4 Days and 3 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation



Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: office@baishideng.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

An interesting review that discussed the immune microenvironment and check point inhibitors in HCC. Several problems need further revision. 1. "ICI in BCLC stage B" and "ICI and TACE" should be integrated into one section. 2. It seems that the value of ICIs in surgery was not discussed in the manuscript.



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Hepatology*

Manuscript NO: 91355

Title: Hepatocellular carcinoma immune microenvironment and Check point inhibitors-Current status

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 05771243

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: India

Manuscript submission date: 2023-12-27

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-12-28 11:44

Reviewer performed review: 2024-01-10 11:51

Review time: 13 Days

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation



Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. What happens- suppression of immune system Both MDSCs and macrophages may derive from monocytes, and MDSCs may differentiate into M2 macrophages. The arrangement of the manuscript is prone to be ambiguity. 2. "Cold and Hot tumours concept" It is simple for this definition. Which reference cited ? M2 TAM is immunosuppression, which should be in Cold or Hot tumors? 3. Why Dendritic cells (DC) are the initiator? The topic of CAF is too brief and you'd better review CAF after Treg. 4. T regulatory cells- suppressors of anti-tumour immunity MDSCs, M2 TAM and N2 TAN are also suppressors of anti-tumour immunity. The title has no characteristic. 5. The figures should be added M1/M2 TAM, N1/N2 TAN, G/M-MDSC.