



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

ESPS manuscript NO: 16223

Title: Effect of body mass index on functional outcomes following arthroplasty procedures

Reviewer's code: 00364821

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2015-01-05 13:09

Date reviewed: 2015-01-18 12:45

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT | CONCLUSION |
|---|---|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected | BPG Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | |
| | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The most important question of this paper is that authors did not elaborate the process of rehabilitation and statistical analysis in details. Also, it is better to give accurate description on method session. The conclusion should be rewritten to give a summary of the research.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

ESPS manuscript NO: 16223

Title: Effect of body mass index on functional outcomes following arthroplasty procedures

Reviewer's code: 02488444

Reviewer's country: Brazil

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2015-01-05 13:09

Date reviewed: 2015-01-14 10:27

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT | CONCLUSION |
|---|--|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor | | <input type="checkbox"/> No | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | BPG Search: | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> No | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

GENERAL COMMENTS ON THE PAPER: An important question was that the authors did not describe with detail and accuracy methodology session, mainly on the evaluation protocol and rehabilitation process. Statistical analysis should be rewritten with details of all tests performed in the study. The results session should be rewritten because it is confusing and difficult to understand. The discussion session needs to be rewritten in order to discuss the findings with the literature and not only infer a study report. Please, it is extremely necessary review this point. The authors need to clarify and explain with more detail on the rationale of the study for better understanding the research problem and its clinical relevance. Just below follows some points to clarify the text content.



ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

ESPS manuscript NO: 16223

Title: Effect of body mass index on functional outcomes following arthroplasty procedures

Reviewer's code: 00646703

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2015-01-05 13:09

Date reviewed: 2015-01-05 23:30

Table with 4 columns: CLASSIFICATION, LANGUAGE EVALUATION, SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT, CONCLUSION. It contains checkboxes for various evaluation criteria like 'Grade A: Excellent', 'Priority publishing', 'Google Search', etc.

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Authors aimed to study the effect of body mass index (BMI) on functional outcomes following arthroplasty procedures. They recruited 513 patients who underwent total knee arthroplasty (TKA), total hip arthroplasty (THA), revision knee arthroplasty (RTKA) and revision hip arthroplasty (RHA). Their follow-up time ranged from 2 to 26 months. Patients had control visits at the 1st month, 6th month, 12th months at the postoperative period. It is not clear how they received data from those who had follow-up less than 12 months. They compared BMI changes following arthroplasty procedures. Unfortunately they failed to collect data that would be valuable to study effect of BMI on functional outcomes. Data reported in the study could not reach any valuable conclusions. The conclusion is not evidence-based since they did not quantify mobilization level and did not record any change in eating habits. The study was poorly designed and could not provide any valuable data to discover the effect of BMI on functional outcomes following arthroplasty procedures. The correlation of BMI and functional outcomes following arthroplasty procedure was not investigated. The follow-up time is too short for almost half of their subjects. It would be more valuable if they



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

could provide functional outcomes with longer follow-up time and focus on the relationships between BMI and functional outcomes for each subgroup. Grouping patients with different surgical procedures may overshadow some existing relationships.