



## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**Manuscript NO:** 47495

**Title:** The Impact of Psychosocial Comorbidities on Clinical Outcomes after Liver Transplantation: Stratification of a High-Risk Population

**Reviewer's code:** 01221925

**Reviewer's country:** Greece

**Science editor:** Li-Jun Cui

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2019-03-23 19:55

**Reviewer performed review:** 2019-03-23 20:09

**Review time:** 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting paper presenting a nice overview of the potential effect of pre-existing psychiatric disorders on the post-transplant life of patients undergoing liver transplantation. Could the authors please comment on the following: a) What are the



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

limitations of the study? b) What about emergency situations (ie acute liver failure due to alcohol) where although there is a history of polysubstance abuse, there is no opportunity to obtain an adequate psychiatric evaluation. c) There is the argument that since it does not affect survival (patient or graft), perhaps the issue of recidivism is not as much of a problem d) The authors may wish to discuss the effect of immunosuppressive medications on these patients e) What do the authors suggest: not offer transplantation to certain patients with psychiatric disorders and if yes to which f) The authors may wish to discuss the proposed times for abstinence

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**Manuscript NO:** 47495

**Title:** The Impact of Psychosocial Comorbidities on Clinical Outcomes after Liver Transplantation: Stratification of a High-Risk Population

**Reviewer’s code:** 03475779

**Reviewer’s country:** Italy

**Science editor:** Li-Jun Cui

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2019-04-09 07:25

**Reviewer performed review:** 2019-04-09 13:44

**Review time:** 6 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer’s expertise on the
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

**SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

Article on an interesting but already much debated topic. Results consistent with the premises. Patients with psychosocial comorbidities also maintained the same comorbidities after the transplant. Transplantation has not changed the pathologies and



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

habits of patients. If they were used to polysubstance abuse, they remained. the study confirms many previous studies and therefore does not add anything new. Some specific concerns : a)The data collected in Tab 1 are unclear. Etiology is not distinguished by gender b)The psychosocial comorbidities should be better defined ,the type of treatment and also in relation to sex. c)In cases of recurrence, were the parameters considered only substance use and non-compliance or can there be other determinants attributable to the host or organ? d)The access date is missing in refrence 2 Ultimately the study methodology and data analysis is not very thorough and not sufficient to support the conclusions

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**Manuscript NO:** 47495

**Title:** The Impact of Psychosocial Comorbidities on Clinical Outcomes after Liver Transplantation: Stratification of a High-Risk Population

**Reviewer’s code:** 00053888

**Reviewer’s country:** United Kingdom

**Science editor:** Li-Jun Cui

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2019-04-09 14:40

**Reviewer performed review:** 2019-04-09 15:00

**Review time:** 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer’s expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

**SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

This is an important study that correlates pre-liver transplant psychiatric co-morbidity with post liver transplant outcome specifically related to psychiatric decompensation. This is also reflected in graft outcome when psychiatric disease impacts on



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

immunosuppressant compliance. The authors have demonstrated that a pre-transplant psychiatric diagnosis if left untreated will lead to a higher rate of decompensation of the psychiatric disorder in the post transplant period. The obvious conclusion is that attention should be given to psychiatric co-morbidity prior to transplant to improve the post-transplant outcomes. the authors have correctly pointed out the limitations of their study.

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**Manuscript NO:** 47495

**Title:** The Impact of Psychosocial Comorbidities on Clinical Outcomes after Liver Transplantation: Stratification of a High-Risk Population

**Reviewer's code:** 00051373

**Reviewer's country:** Taiwan

**Science editor:** Li-Jun Cui

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2019-04-09 12:23

**Reviewer performed review:** 2019-04-11 12:42

**Review time:** 2 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> General
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

**SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

The manuscript is well written.

**INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**



# Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](https://www.wjgnet.com)

### *Google Search:*

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

### *BPG Search:*

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No