

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 22035

Title: Inflammatory Bowel Disease Associated Neoplasia: A Surgeon's Perspective

Reviewer's code: 00058696

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2015-08-11 17:41

Date reviewed: 2015-09-11 04:08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

We have examined this review article. The authors describe their work as a comprehensive review. Please describe what steps were taken to evaluate literature to be included in this comprehensive review. Introduction, page 4, paragraph 2: "IBD-CRC arises from dysplasia in flat mucosa" but then on page 6 under "Natural history of", one sees "recent data suggests that sequential progression from inflammation to LGD ... does not always occur". I certainly agree with page 6, and so I would be more conservative about the descriptions on page 4. Bob Riddell's work in this field and the question of an absence of progression from dysplasia in ulcerative colitis began in 1974 (Gut; 15: 822-41). Absence of progression is not a recent idea (page 6 under "Natural history"). Page 6: "dysplasia in IBD is being detected more and more"; please rewrite sentence and provide a reference for this statement. In Screening guidelines, page 10; clearly chromoendoscopy with targeted biopsies can't or won't occur nationally or internationally. Please comment on the difficulties initiating this guideline. Please comment on the potential effect of this guideline on colectomy rates. Page 10-11 "Dye-based"; "a 7% difference"; in what, authors please specify. Page 13, Strictures: "If a known stricture ... completely evaluated by biopsy". How would you



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

know whether it had or had not been "completely" evaluated? Completely sounds like transmural specimen is required. How can you reliably distinguish benign from malignant strictures in ulcerative colitis (see for example SJM Goulston, NEJM 1969; 281: 290-5). P 15, risk of adenocarcinoma in retained rectum: please comment on the risk of recurrent bleeding from retained mucosa and its evaluation/treatment. Then page 15, Next line, "infact" should be "in fact". Page 16, complications of restorative proctocolectomy; please make a table. P 17,"Surgical options for": authors, please clearly discuss potential risks, evaluation of, and management of long standing terminal ileal stricture in Crohn's disease and adenocarcinoma. Data top of page 19 (Neoplasia and risk factors): authors, please make a table. Page 20, "Prognosis and long-term": authors, please make a table.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 22035

Title: Inflammatory Bowel Disease Associated Neoplasia: A Surgeon's Perspective

Reviewer's code: 00503587

Reviewer's country: New Zealand

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2015-08-11 17:41

Date reviewed: 2015-08-25 16:47

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review focuses upon key aspects of IBD-associated cancer. It is clear, direct and well-written. The first section of the Introduction includes a number of statements that are unreferenced. Addition of relevant references would be helpful. The Legend for Table 2 should be enhanced (to make this more independent)