



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Radiology

Manuscript NO: 32694

Title: Reliability of the pronator quadratus fat pad sign to predict the severity of distal radius fractures

Reviewer’s code: 03518978

Reviewer’s country: United States

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2017-05-05

Date reviewed: 2017-05-08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This study evaluated the correlation of the PQC thickness in CR and CT in 89 consecutive patients with distal forearm trauma. 44/89 patients (49%) had a distal radius fracture. Mean thickness of the PQC thickness can reliably be measured on X-ray views and was 7.5 ± 2.8mm in lateral views (CR), respectively 9.4 ± 3.0mm in sagittal reconstructions (CT), resulting in a significant correlation coefficient of 0.795. A positive PQS at CR was present in 21/44 patients (48%) with distal radius fracture and in 2/45 patients (4%) without distal radius fracture, resulting in a specificity of 96% and a sensitivity of 48% for the detection of distal radius fractures. There was no correlation between thickness of the PQC and severity of distal radius fractures. Overall, this is an interesting study. It can give clinicians some useful information for the their practice. Please add one anatomic picture of the pronator quadratus fat pad complex. It will be helpful to understand this topic.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Radiology

Manuscript NO: 32694

Title: Reliability of the pronator quadratus fat pad sign to predict the severity of distal radius fractures

Reviewer's code: 03675966

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2017-05-05

Date reviewed: 2017-05-09

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

It is very interesting study which investigated the relationship between pronator quadratus fat pad sign and distal radius fractures. However, the authors did not address how the true lateral radiographs of distal radius achieved. Rotation of wrist can influence the accuracy of measurements. Besides, the measurements were performed on the radiographs. What is the inter- and intraobserver variability? The authors should state them in details and make the measurements well understood by the readers.