BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells
ESPS manuscript NO: 13011
Title: CD271 as a marker to Identify Mesenchymal Stem Cells from Diverse Sources before Culture
Reviewer code: 00504125
Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji
Date sent for review: 2014-08-12 19:16
Date reviewed: 2014-09-02 21:40

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] Existing	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[ ] Existing	[Y] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[ ] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The phenotypic expression of CD271 of mesenchymal stem cells needs to compare with others to CD73, CD90 and CD105. It will be desirable more discussions about these.

BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells
ESPS manuscript NO: 13011
Title: CD271 as a marker to Identify Mesenchymal Stem Cells from Diverse Sources before Culture
Reviewer code: 02438878
Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji
Date sent for review: 2014-08-12 19:16
Date reviewed: 2014-09-24 09:31

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[Y] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] Existing	[Y] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[ ] Existing	[ ] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[ ] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review summarized the recent papers whether CD271 would be defined as a universal marker to identify mesenchymal stem cells before culture from different sources. They found that in the case of bone marrow or adipose tissue, CD271 could be considered a quite suitable maker; however this marker seems not to be adequate for the isolation of mesenchymal stem cells from other tissues such as umbilical cord blood or wharton's jelly among others. The paper is well presented, only few language polishing which are highlighted in PDF attached.

BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells
ESPS manuscript NO: 13011
Title: CD271 as a marker to Identify Mesenchymal Stem Cells from Diverse Sources before Culture
Reviewer code: 00646562
Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji
Date sent for review: 2014-08-12 19:16
Date reviewed: 2014-10-07 19:15

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[Y] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] Existing	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[ ] Existing	[Y] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[ ] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Alvarez-Viejo and colleagues revise CD271 as a marker for naive MSCs. The article is well written although minor English polishing is desirable. It summarizes an interesting area of adult stem cell translation in quite a comprehensive way and thus merits publication. However several corrections should be made before article acceptance: 1. No reference is made to the articles by Bruno Peault's group (Crisan et al., 2008; Corselli et al., 2012) showing that MSCs derive from pericytes and/or adventitial cells in vivo. These articles should be quoted and discussed with regard to CD271 expression by human mural cells in situ, if any. 2. A previous study by Mabuchi and colleagues (Stem Cell Rep 1: 152, 2013) shows that CD271 expression in combination with other markers allows for the selection of more primitive MSCs with better differentiation potentials (in human beings). This article must be given relevance in the review and adequately discussed. 3. Membrane markers are notoriously dynamic and even worse; their expression/detection can often be dependent on minor technical issues (see for instance Hines et al Cell Reports, 2014). This discussion is very relevant in the frame of this paper and it should be reflected upon. 4. Equally important, MSC cultures are heterogeneous and contaminant CD271+ cells may be present in primary cultures of some of the tissues discussed. This should also be mentioned since there are many other cell types in the body that express CD271 and this fact has been overlooked by the authors.