



# BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 17659

**Title:** Biomarkers for the early diagnosis of hepatocellular carcinoma

**Reviewer's code:** 03261944

**Reviewer's country:** Belgium

**Science editor:** Yuan Qi

**Date sent for review:** 2015-03-18 08:55

**Date reviewed:** 2015-03-18 20:10

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the present study Dr. Tetsuya Nakatsura and co-workers review the value of biomarkers that are used for the early diagnosis of HCC. The Manuscript is clearly written and coherently structured. Although several recent reviews were published on this topic, HCC biomarker development remains an important field of clinical liver research. My comments to the Authors are listed below in the attached pdf file.



# BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 17659

**Title:** Biomarkers for the early diagnosis of hepatocellular carcinoma

**Reviewer's code:** 02992401

**Reviewer's country:** China

**Science editor:** Yuan Qi

**Date sent for review:** 2015-03-18 08:55

**Date reviewed:** 2015-03-19 09:30

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors reviewed the possible clinical biomarkers and recent progress for early diagnosis of HCC. The manuscript is well written, and will be benefit for the community. I suggest to publish this manuscript without revision.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 17659

**Title:** Biomarkers for the early diagnosis of hepatocellular carcinoma

**Reviewer's code:** 03119228

**Reviewer's country:** China

**Science editor:** Yuan Qi

**Date sent for review:** 2015-03-18 08:55

**Date reviewed:** 2015-03-28 10:07

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In general, this paper is well organized and writtern. However, in my opinion, a major revision is need to enable the manuscript to be published in "World Journal of Gastroenteroly". Suggestions are listed below: ?Please enter keyword "HCC"; "Biomarker"; "Early diagnosis" in Pubmed, you will find a lot of relevant updated atticles and reviews. I hope the author review through these papers, and add new associated research and progression in the submission to reorganize this paper. This paper is worth being improved. ?Too much key words in the paper. ?Please check the second/third leading cause of cancer-related deaths. I am confused. Second?Third? ?In addition, the reference 1 and reference 4 is similar and one is in 2011, one is in 2013. Maybe 2013 is better. ?The first author in the references should be in bold. Right? ?Please add associated references which are more updated and of high quality in this paper. The references already existed in thia paper need to be simplified. ?Please check the spelling and the layout in the whole paper carefully yourselves to avoid minor mistakes. Why a blank page in the end? ?Paragraph 2 in Page 3, "Unfortunately, even this is inadequate, and very few HCC biomarkers have sufficiently high sensitivity for the detection of early stage HCC". I could not understand. ?Paragraph 2 in Page 4, "AFP has been considered the most



## BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

---

common and useful biomarker for HCC evaluation, because it was discovered in the serum of HCC patients in 1964[8]. " Here the use of because is weird. Finally, Good luck to you!



# BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 17659

**Title:** Biomarkers for the early diagnosis of hepatocellular carcinoma

**Reviewer's code:** 00058159

**Reviewer's country:** Taiwan

**Science editor:** Yuan Qi

**Date sent for review:** 2015-03-18 08:55

**Date reviewed:** 2015-03-31 10:47

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors had reviewed 10 tumor biomarkers for early detection of HCC. The details of each biomarker were well-reviewed. The conclusion is reasonable. However, in the "Abstract" paragraph, the conclusions after the review should briefly mentioned. They defined that early-stage of HCC was BCLC stage 0 and A, the reported 5-year disease-free and overall survival rates of early HCC after treatment should be provided in the "Introduction" section of the text.